POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE:

PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

> POLICY PAPER JANUARY - FEBRUARY 2024



HEINRICH BÖLL STIFTUNG KYIV

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

POLICY PAPER

JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

This study of public access to decision-making related to the recovery of Ukraine in the context of environmental protection and climate change mitigation was conducted within the implementation of the project funded by the Heinrich Böll Foundation, Kyiv office — Ukraine, in January–February 2024 by analyzing current processes around the planning of Ukraine's future and ongoing reconstruction in order to determine (1) opportunities and barriers for environmental and climate civil society representatives to participate in these processes and influence decision-making to make reconstruction "greener", and (2) level of "greenness" of the reconstruction processes, namely how they take into account the need to protect environment and mitigate climate change during the recovery.

The information provided in this publication represents aggregated results of a policy paper and the authors' interpretation, which does not necessarily reflect the official position of the Heinrich Böll Foundation and the Government of Germany.

Authors:

Andriy Andrusevych, senior policy expert, Resource and Analysis Center "Society and Environment" Zoryana Kozak, senior policy expert, Resource and Analysis Center "Society and Environment"

© Heinrich Böll Foundation, Kyiv office – Ukraine, 2024 © RAC "Society and Environment", 2024

5	ACRONYMS
7	SUMMARY
1	INTRODUCTION
3	SECTION 1. DOMESTIC POLITICAL PROCESSES FOR POST-WAR RECONSTRUCTION
4 4	1.1 Overview of the processes a) National recovery planning processes

- 16 b) Sectoral processes
- 18 c) Local processes
- 19 d) Non-governmental processes
- 20 1.2 Stakeholders
- 23 1.3 Greenness of the processes
- 25 1.4 Public participation

28 SECTION 2. INTERNATIONAL PROCESSES FOR POST-WAR RECOVERY

29	2.1 Over	view of the	processes

- a) Overarching international processes
- b) International assistance and cooperation
- 392.2 Stakeholders
- 40 2.3 Greenness of the processes
- 41 2.4 Public participation

43 SECTION 3. INSTITUTIONAL AND ORGANIZATIONAL RECOVERY PROCESSES

- 44 3.1 Description of the processes
- 44 a) Governmental leve
- 45 b) Recovery agency
- 46 c) DREAM
- d) The Fund for Recovery from the Consequences of Aggression
- 46 e) Patronage over the regions
- 47 3.2 Stakeholders
- 48 3.3 Greenness of the processes
- 49 3.4 Public participation

50 SECTION 4. KEY TRENDS IN 2023

- 51 4.1 Changes compared to 2022
- 55 4.2 Tools for public participation
- 56 4.3 Conclusions
- 59 4.4 Recommendations

63 APPENDIXES

- 64 Appendix 1. Timeline of events rebuilding and recovery of Ukraine
- 72 Appendix 2. Mapping of processes and stakeholders (2023)
- **74 Appendix 3.** Examples of good practices of interaction between the public and other stakeholders in Ukraine's post-war rebuilding and recovery
- 74 3.1 State Regional Development Strategy
- 77 3.2 NEB and cooperation with Ukraine during the war
- 78 3.3 CSOs help Ukrainian communities
- 80 3.4 DREAM, a unified digital ecosystem for recovery management
- 81 3.5 Voznesensk community

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

ACRONYMS

Action Plan API BRDO CBAM CMU CSO CSP DOBRE Draft Ukraine Plan	Action Plan for the Post-War Recovery and Development of Ukraine Application Programming Interface Better Regulation Delivery Office Carbon Border Adjustment Mechanism Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine Civil Society Organization Civil Society Platform USAID Decentralization Offering Better Results and Efficiency Activity Draft Ukraine Plan for implementing reforms as part of the European Commission's
	proposed Regulation of the European Parliament and the Council of the European Union establishing the Ukraine Facility
DREAM	Digital Restoration Ecosystem for Accountable Management
EaP CSF	Eastern Partnership Civil Society Forum
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ECO-RC	Resource Center for Green Recovery of Mykolaiv Oblast
EFF	Extended Fund Facility
EIB	European Investment Bank
ENGAGE	USAID Enhance Non-Governmental Actors and Grassroots Engagement Activity
EPAIU	Economic Partnership Agreement
EU	European Union
EU4U	EU Initiative for Ukraine
GIZ	German Society for International Development

GMF HPP IDP IFI IMF IRF IT JICA MCDF NEB NEFCO NGO PEACE	German Marshall Fund of the United States Hydroelectric Power Plant Internally Displaced Person International Financial Institution International Monetary Fund International Renaissance Foundation Information Technology Japan International Cooperation Agency Mykolaiv City Development Fund New European Bauhaus Nordic Environment Finance Corporation Non-Governmental Organization Public Expenditures for Administrative Capacity Endurance Project Rapid Damage and Recovery Needs
	Assessment
Recovery Agency	State Agency for the Restoration and Development of Infrastructure of Ukraine
RISE Ukraine	Ukraine's Reconstruction, Integrity, Sustainability, and Efficiency Coalition
RPR	Reanimation Package of Reforms
RRR4Ukraine	Resilience, Reconstruction, and Relief for Ukraine
U.S.	United States of America
UAH	Ukrainian Hryvnia
UK	United Kingdom
U-LEAD	Ukraine – Local Empowerment, Accountability and Development
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
URC	Ukraine Recovery Conferences
URTF	Ukraine Relief, Recovery, Reconstruction, and
USAID	Reform Trust Fund United States Agency for International Development
USESC	Unified State Electronic System for
	Construction Projects
VRU	Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine (Parliament)

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

SUMMARY

The policy paper "Post-War Green Reconstruction of Ukraine: Processes, Stakeholders, Public Participation" presents the results of a study on planning and implementing post-war reconstruction in Ukraine, as well as the main institutional and organizational reconstruction processes. The report reflects the trends and progress made in 2023 in planning and implementing green post-war reconstruction in Ukraine at the national, international, and local levels, as well as in ensuring public participation and transparency of these processes.

The post-war reconstruction of Ukraine is a challenge not only for the government and people of Ukraine, but also for the entire international community. The complexity of planning, financing, and implementing reconstruction is unprecedented, especially in an ongoing war. The reconstruction process will be the most ambitious project in Europe since World War II, determining the basis for Ukraine's future development for many decades to come and changing the world order. It requires the unification and consolidation of efforts by everyone, including the government, academia, business, the public, and international partners.

Planning for Ukraine's national post-war reconstruction and recovery is now ongoing. In early 2024, Ukraine does not have a single national reconstruction and recovery strategy. The national planning process in the form of a special action plan has been curtailed and partially replaced by Ukraine Plan under the Ukraine Facility. Sectoral and local planning processes have begun to consider the post-war reconstruction needs, and it is a clear necessity to consider them in further sectoral and local development planning. Some of the main international partners are demonstrating their own strategic vision and role in Ukraine's reconstruction and recovery.

The conceptual understanding of Ukraine's post-war reconstruction and recovery based on the principle of "build back better and greener" has not been formed, which affects its practical implementation. The effectiveness and efficiency of recovery and reconstruction is also complicated by the fact that the stakeholders (government, partners, the public, business, and local authorities) have not developed a clear understanding of green recovery. They agree politically and proclaim the need for "green recovery", taking into account climate and environmental issues. However, the public discourse in 2023 did not feature a structured and substantive discussion of the concept of green recovery. In fact, its understanding is being replaced by the practice of implementing specific projects, especially at the local level, which usually involve renewable energy sources and implementing basic environmental practices and mechanisms. Such an approach causes fragmentation and narrows the understanding of green recovery to isolated, rather basic components in terms of strategic vision. Ukraine's green recovery requires the attention of international partners, but only a few of them use this approach in their programs in Ukraine.

Positive changes have also occurred in terms of transparency and stakeholder involvement in formulating and implementation Ukraine's green recovery and reconstruction. Yet, it is too early to say that this has become a routine practice of the national authorities and international partners. The government is paying more attention to public involvement at the planning stage. Drafting of the new version of the State Strategy for Regional Development 2021-2027 is a good example. At the same time, other sectoral processes are still closed to the public. Digitalizing the rebuilding and recovery processes, namely launching the DREAM e-platform, contributed to implementing the principles of transparency and engagement.

The need for civil society involvement remains relevant throughout all stages of recovery and rebuilding, starting from the early stages and at different levels of planning and rebuilding. In 2023, there was a spike in cooperation between civil society organizations (CSOs) and local authorities on specific post-war recovery projects, which is likely due to the greater openness of local authorities to cooperation and the smaller scale of projects. The issue of transparency and public participation in international processes needs to be further addressed, and international partners need to demonstrate leadership and goodwill in ensuring such principles of governance. International financial institutions remain untransparent in terms of public engagement. The analytical paper offers a number of **cross-cutting recommendations** for planning and implementation, as well as awareness and engagement in the green recovery processes in Ukraine, which apply to all stakeholders. In particular:

Adherence to the principles of participatory democracy and "build back better and greener" at **all stages of Ukraine's recovery and rebuilding** – planning, implementation, monitoring, and oversight;

Ensuring transparency and public involvement in the development and elaboration of the **entire system of planning documents** for reconstruction – national, sectoral, regional, and local;

Ensuring transparency and accessibility both within the framework of both **national and international processes** for Ukraine's recovery and reconstruction;

Restoring the consolidation of all stakeholders' efforts, which should be seen as a fundamental condition for the post-war recovery and rebuilding of Ukraine. Consolidating the efforts of the entire society and government at the beginning of a full-scale war is an example of how joint cohesion saved the country and the people;

Strengthening key national and international stakeholders' cooperation with Ukrainian civil society on a regular, predetermined, and clearly defined basis, **enhancing the synergy of efforts** in Ukraine's rebuilding and recovery;

Taking into account European Union (EU) environmental and climate acquis requirements in the process of rebuilding Ukraine, which will contribute to both green recovery and development of Ukraine and accession to the EU;

Taking into account and meeting the needs of communities and residents in the process of rebuilding Ukraine and localizing the process, as communities beneficiaries and will actually implement measures to rebuild and recover Ukraine at the local level;

Further digitalizing national and international processes of Ukraine's rebuilding and recovery is one of the key mechanisms for ensuring the transparency and accessibility of the processes.

In addition, the paper contains recommendations for specific stakeholders, taking into account the processes and events that took place in 2023. The recommendations address ways for

implementing the principle of "build back better and greener"; creating the architecture of strategic planning for the reconstruction and recovery of Ukraine; institutionalizing and digitalizing reconstruction processes; and strengthening public engagement, efficiency, and effectiveness of participating in the processes of green rebuilding and recovery.

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

INTRODUCTION

Having recovered from the shock of the aggressive full-scale war Russia launched in 2022, Ukraine and its international partners began planning Ukraine's post-war reconstruction in 2022. The main features and principles of Ukraine's post-war recovery began to take shape in 2022, including developing a national plan to overcome the consequences of the war and adopt the principles of recovery in Lugano, Switzerland.

It is clear that Ukraine's post-war reconstruction will become the largest project in Europe since World War II. The reconstruction process will determine the foundations of the country's future development for decades to come. The complexity of planning, financing, and implementing the tasks is unprecedented for the Government and people of Ukraine, which is why an essential principle is of the planning process is to properly involve all stakeholders. Identifying strategic goals, such as a sustainable, secure, and climate-neutral state, should take into account both citizens' opinions and Ukraine's European future.

This is the second report we have prepared since Russia's full-scale invasion of Ukraine began on February 24, 2022. It reflects the results of a study on the progress made in 2023 in planning and implementing green post-war recovery in Ukraine at the national and international levels, as well as ensuring public participation in these processes.

This report answers many questions. What is happening with the national plan for recovery from the consequences of the war? Who is planning Ukraine's post-war recovery, if any? What is the role of international financial institutions? Does reconstruction take place at the local level? What is the public doing? How green are the post-war recovery processes? The paper also answers many other important questions.

<u>The structure of the report</u> reflects the main research objectives and methodological principles:

The first two sections provide an analysis of national (including local) and international post-war reconstruction planning/ implementation processes that took place in 2023, an analysis of stakeholders, how "green" the process was, and public participation therein;

Section 3 is dedicated to analyzing the main institutional and organizational processes (for example, creating the deputy minister posts for recovery or the status of the idea of patronage over the regions), including stakeholder analysis, the green nature of the processes, and public participation;

The fourth and final section presents the conclusions for 2023, namely, what has changed since 2022, the most effective public participation tools, and the main conclusions and recommendations.

In the appendices, we offer several items that illustrate and elaborate some of the trends we have identified. Appendix 1 provides a chronological timeline of the main events related to post-war recovery efforts in 2023. Appendix 2 is our attempt to map the main players and their role in the various processes of post-war recovery in Ukraine. In Appendix 3, we offer a summary of what we consider to be the best practices in planning and implementing post-war recovery, i.e., practices that exemplify unity, cooperation, openness, and a green approach to post-war reconstruction.

We are grateful to everyone who supported, planned, carried out, participated, and provided information about the incredible efforts of our people to recover from the consequences of Russia's aggression in 2023.

SECTION 1

DOMESTIC POLITICAL PROCESSES FOR POST-WAR RECONSTRUCTION

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

POLICY PAPER - JANUARY - FEBRUARY 2024



POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

SECTION 1. DOMESTIC POLITICAL PROCESSES FOR POST-WAR RECONSTRUCTION

1.1 OVERVIEW OF THE PROCESSES

Today, Ukraine's post-war recovery is one of the main factors influencing political planning processes at various levels, both at the national and sectoral levels and at the local and community levels. The issues of recovery and reconstruction are incorporated into the existing architecture of government planning documents. Currently, solutions are being developed that focus on the recovery and reconstruction of the entire state, the regions, and communities.

A) NATIONAL RECOVERY PLANNING PROCESSES

ACTION PLAN FOR POSTWAR RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT OF UKRAINE

The *National Council for the Recovery of Ukraine from the War* was established by the Decree of the President of Ukraine on April 21,

2022, as an advisory body to the President of Ukraine. One of its main objectives was to develop an Action Plan for the Post-War Recovery and Development of Ukraine (Action Plan). The Action Plan's underlying materials were prepared for the July 2022 Ukraine Recovery Conference in Lugano, Switzerland, and the materials were finalized later in 2022.

A webpage was created on the Government of Ukraine website with summarized information about the National Council for the Recovery of Ukraine from the War and working groups' materials supplementing the Action Plan. However, the webpage has been down for a long time, and the Action Plan materials are not available. However, they can be found on the official <u>website</u> of the Lugano *Conference* on Ukraine's Recovery.

There is no information in publicly available sources regarding the further status of elaborating, reviewing, and adopting the Action Plan. Any references to the plan and its status have disappeared from public speeches by senior officials and ministry representatives.

UKRAINE PLAN (WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK OF THE UKRAINE FACILITY)

On June 20, 2023, the European Commission <u>proposed</u> establishing a new instrument, the Ukraine Facility, to provide financial support in the amount of up to €50 billion for the recovery and rebuilding of Ukraine in 2024-2027. To facilitate providing and receiving support, the Government of Ukraine prepared the Ukraine Plan, which details its vision for the country's recovery, rebuilding, and modernization and the reforms it intends to implement.

In early October 2023, the Ukrainian media reported that the Government of Ukraine had begun work on a unified Reform Plan 2027, as <u>announced</u> by the Prime Minister of Ukraine. According to Denys Shmyhal, the Reform Plan should become a consolidated document, a kind of roadmap for reforms that will cover all areas affecting government institutions, the economy, and public relations. The plan should be based on President Zelensky's <u>Concept for Strengthening the Resilience of Democracy in Ukraine</u> and take into account international partners' proposals.

An Interagency Working Group developed the draft Ukraine Plan as part of the implementation of the European Commission's proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council of the European Union establishing the Ukraine Facility. The Government of Ukraine approved the text on December 27, 2023, for further consultations with the EU.

The <u>draft Ukraine Plan</u> for implementing reforms as part of the European Commission's proposed Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council establishing the Ukraine Facility (draft Ukraine Plan) consists of three sections covering the overall architecture of Ukraine's recovery and the plan's place and role, reforms in relevant sectors and areas of recovery, and monitoring and oversight over plan implementation.

As stated in the draft Ukraine Plan, in the system of government planning documents for the recovery and development of Ukraine in 2024-2027, this plan will play a major role implying synchronization of other public administration plans with the Ukraine Plan, harmonization of sectoral strategic plans developed by line ministries and cross-sectoral documents, such as the State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027 and implementation plan, regional and community development strategies, comprehensive recovery programs, community recovery and development plans, etc.

B) SECTORAL PROCESSES

REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

In December 2023, the Ministry for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine developed and published the Draft Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine (CMU) <u>Resolution</u> "On Amendments to the State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027", which proposes approving a new version of the State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027, approved by CMU Resolution #695 of August 5, 2020.

According to its authors, adopting a new strategy will ensure that the provisions of the State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027 are brought in line with the new requirements of the Law "On the Principles of State Regional Policy" (as amended in July 2022) in terms of deepening the understanding of government's regional policy, with a focus on the recovery of regions and communities, expanding European integration processes, and continuing decentralization reform, taking into account new challenges.

OTHER SECTORAL STRATEGIES

In 2023, some central executive authorities developed sectoral strategies and plans, subsequently approved by the Government, that mainly take into account the needs related to overcoming the consequences of Russia's aggression.

In December 2023, the Ministry of Digital Transformation presented the <u>WINWIN – Ukrainian Global Innovation Vision</u>, describing the main areas of the country's development today and after victory. Formally, it is known as Ukraine's Innovation Strategy 2030, which was drafted by the government.

In spring 2023, the government approved a new *Energy Strategy* 2050, which was developed with the support of the United Kingdom (UK) government. However, the text of the strategy is classified and there is no information about any public consultations or discussions of it.

The Ministry of Economy of Ukraine developed the <u>draft National</u> <u>Energy and Climate Plan</u> and published in February 2024.

In the fall, the Ministry of Environment developed a new national waste management plan and launched its <u>strategic environmental</u> <u>assessment</u> in December 2023.

The Ministry of Reconstruction developed the Strategy for Thermal Modernization of Buildings in Ukraine 2050 (adopted in early 2024), a concept for the State Targeted Economic Program to Support Thermal Modernization of Buildings 2030, and the Operational Action Plan 2024-2026.

C) LOCAL PROCESSES

The key laws that define the planning and implementation of Ukraine's recovery and rebuilding are the Law "On the Principles of State Regional Policy" and the Law "On the Regulation of Urban Development", which provide for adopting the <u>following</u>:

At the regional level, regional development strategies and action plans, comprehensive regional recovery programs, and regional recovery and development plans;

At the local level, strategies and action plans for developing territorial communities, plans for the recovery and development of communities, and programs for the comprehensive recovery of territories belonging to territorial communities.

The vision of a unified architecture for recovery planning is outlined in the draft Ukraine Plan. The key to creating the recovery architecture's foundation is the coherence and synchronization of plans, including the Ukraine Plan. As stated in the draft Ukraine Plan, the Government is preparing a unified system of recovery-related documents at the national, regional, and local levels. Government agencies have adopted a number of documents aimed at enabling regions and territorial communities to adopt recovery planning documents, including inter alia documents on developing <u>regional</u> <u>development strategies</u>, <u>territorial community development strategies</u>, <u>programs for comprehensive recovery of regions and territories of</u> <u>territorial communities</u>, and holding public discussions.

The Unified State Electronic System for Construction Projects (*USESC*) web portal presents information on comprehensive recovery programs for the regions and territorial communities. As of January 2024, programs for 14 regions and 26 territorial communities have been published.

International partners also support local communities in developing relevant recovery planning documents. For example, in February-October 2023, the USAID Decentralization Offering Better Results and Efficiency Activity (DOBRE) and 18 territorial communities in Kirovohrad, Mykolaiv, Kharkiv, and Kherson oblasts developed comprehensive territorial recovery programs. The <u>Methodology for</u> <u>Developing a Comprehensive Territorial Recovery Program</u> was prepared as part of this program.

D) NON-GOVERNMENTAL PROCESSES

The public is proactively involved in the processes of Ukraine's recovery and rebuilding, drafting relevant policies, and implementing specific reconstruction projects. The non-governmental sector demonstrates its political vision of Ukraine's recovery and reconstruction to ensure that the public voice is heard and considered both in planning and implementing recovery and rebuilding efforts. Already at the beginning of planning international processes for Ukraine's recovery, civil society organizations (CSOs) issued a number of political documents and petitions expressing their vision of the principles for rebuilding Ukraine entirely and for specific sectors of the economy. The Civil Society Manifesto 2022 (Lugano Declaration), the Statement of the Working Group 5 "Energy, Transport, Environment and Climate Change" of the Ukrainian side to the EU-Ukraine Civil Society Platform, and Working Group 3 of the Eastern Partnership Civil Society Forum National Platform are among civil society's political statements addressed to the government and international community.

Non-governmental sector representatives also joined the processes of developing planning documents for the Ukraine's recovery and rebuilding, in particular those prepared as part of developing the draft Action Plan for the Post-war Reconstruction and Development of Ukraine and the draft Ukraine Plan. In addition to involving civil society representatives in working groups, CSOs submitted their proposals and recommendations to the relevant draft plans. The format of public involvement and the consideration of their proposals raised concern, so, among other things, a number of CSOs outlined their vision of these plans in position papers (e.g., *position paper* on the Action Plan for Postwar Recovery and Development of Ukraine and *position paper* on the draft Ukraine Plan). Civil society representatives also used the mechanisms of public participation in EU decision-making, in particular, submitting proposals to the draft Ukraine Facility Regulation.

The main ways in which the <u>non-governmental sector is involved</u> in <u>recovery</u> include organizing public events, collecting and disseminating information, conducting research, educating, training, etc. They hold conferences, forums, and other events to draw attention to public involvement in the political processes of rebuilding and recovery. For example, on September 29-30, 2022, the <u>conference</u> "From Resilience to Recovery: The Key Role of Ukrainian Civil Society" was held in Kyiv and Lviv to discuss the civil society's role in Ukraine's recovery. A series of *regional forums*, "Civil Society Manifesto in Drafting and Implementation of the Recovery Plan for Ukraine", were held in 2023 to engage a wide range of civil society in Ukraine's recovery and modernization.

Another significant civil society contribution to recovery and reconstruction is the support of selected communities and residents in the physical restoration of buildings and infrastructure; assistance in finding financial support for communities; developing planning documents dealing with recovery; and community capacity building, including training and information. For example, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) *Ecoaction* and *Ecoclub* implement green recovery projects for selected communities.

1.2 STAKEHOLDERS

<u>Participants</u> in national processes for planning and implementing government policy on recovery and reconstruction include:

The President of Ukraine, in terms of security issues and creating the necessary advisory bodies (e.g., the National Council for the Recovery of Ukraine from the War);

The Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine (VRU), in terms of adopting the necessary laws;

The Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, central executive authorities (responsible for drafting and implementation of relevant policies);

Local executive authorities, Autonomous Republic of Crimea authorities, and local government bodies, being responsible for drafting and implementing relevant policies in regions and communities.

Ukrainian legislation provides for local government associations and their voluntary associations to participate in developing and implementing relevant policies. In July 2022, the European Committee of the Regions and associations of local and regional authorities from the EU and Ukraine launched the *European Alliance of Cities and Regions for the Reconstruction of Ukraine*. One of its objectives is to coordinate joint efforts with EU cities and regions willing to mobilize resources to support the effective and sustainable reconstruction of Ukraine and facilitate the provision of expertise in capacity building, good governance, and technical assistance to cities and regions of Ukraine (Berdychiv, Vinnytsia, Lviv, Poltava, and Zakarpattya oblast) and individual NGOs have become associate members of the Alliance.

<u>Cities4Cities</u> | <u>United4Ukraine</u> are partnership initiatives that merged in September 2022 and made official on February 27, 2023, at the Municipal Partnership Forum in Sindelfingen, Germany. Cities4Cities is responsible for humanitarian aid projects, children and youth camps, and partnership projects such as healthcare, cultural and educational institutions, and <u>PHOENIX4UA</u>, a humanitarian aid project to support the recovery of Ukrainian communities by providing used municipal vehicles and equipment. United4Ukraine is responsible for <u>developing</u> <u>municipal partnerships</u> with Ukrainian cities. United4Ukraine's support to the Cities4Cities initiative is one of the components of the <u>Support to Decentralization in Ukraine</u> – Phase II project (implemented by SALAR INTERNATIONAL), which covers all regions of Ukraine.

The Ministry for the Restoration of Ukraine maintains a register of bilateral and multilateral agreements concluded by communities and regions, including registered agreements on restoring and rebuilding communities and regions: <u>Register of Cross-Border</u> Cooperation Agreements, <u>Register of Cooperation Agreements</u> of <u>Territorial Communities</u>.

A number of initiatives have been launched to support the capacity of Ukraine's regions and communities to implement specific reforms and recovery and reconstruction projects. For example, the government launched the Communities Support Team, a working group under the Ministry of Recovery with the mission of bringing together the efforts of all development partners and the Ministry of Reconstruction to develop joint solutions, synchronize recovery measures, and prioritize needs. The platform plans to bring together initiatives, projects, and programs that are working or planning to work at the local level. The group's first meeting was in December 2023. The Recovery and Development Offices were opened as a platform for cooperation between local authorities, international organizations, NGOs, and businesses to coordinate international assistance and prioritize recovery projects. As of the beginning of 2024, offices had been established at the regional level in Kharkiv, Mykolaiv, and two in Dnipro to support the Donetsk and Luhansk oblast administrations, and at the community level in Sumy, Nizhyn, Mykolaiv, Pervomaisk, Kamianske, and Voznesensk. The United Nations Development Program (UNDP) in Ukraine opened the offices in partnership with the EU and the governments of Denmark and Sweden.

The war, and the need for further recovery and rebuilding in Ukraine, directly affected CSOs' activities. On the one hand, CSOs themselves needed support for their own operations (financial, organizational, institutional capacity, etc.). On the other hand, they have become actively involved in rebuilding and restoring Ukraine, and the focus of their activities has shifted from doing recovery and rebuilding as one of their work areas or projects to networking and creating associations around Ukraine's green recovery.

<u>The formats for uniting the public</u> round recovery and rebuilding vary and to summarize the practice, we can identify the following:

Targeted networking of the public sector, which involves creating new coalitions, consortia, and groups, such as the coalition of Ukrainian and international organizations RISE Ukraine, Resilience, Reconstruction, and Relief for Ukraine consortium (RRR4Ukraine), and the informal group of CSOs called Rebuild Ukraine Green;

Expanding and introducing new activities among existing CSOs, in particular, the Reanimation Package of Reforms (RPR) coalition, the Ukrainian party to the EU-Ukraine Civil Society Platform, and the Ukrainian National Platform of the Eastern Partnership Civil Society Forum;

Implementing initiatives within the framework of existing public platforms or NGOs.

The main support for the public sector, including financial support, is provided by international institutions, programs, projects, and other states. For example, <u>"Ukraine: Assistance, Resilience, Recovery" (GMF)</u> / U3R is a program of the German Marshall Fund

of the United States (GMF), which was created in response to Russia's war to support Ukrainian citizens, civic activists, CSOs, journalists, and independent media. The program primarily provides direct support to civil society actors, but also supports the involvement of Ukrainian civil society and local communities in planning recovery efforts and strengthens the role of civic and media actors in designing, implementing, and overseeing recovery efforts at the local, national, and international levels.

Donors support civil society projects on green recovery and reconstructing Ukraine and expanding its participation. Examples include the *International Renaissance Foundation* (IRF), ISAR Ednannia, and the USAID *Enhance Non-Governmental Actors and Grassroots Engagement Activity* (ENGAGE).

1.3 GREENNESS OF THE PROCESSES

The draft Action Plan for the Post-war Reconstruction and Development of Ukraine, suspended for the time being, included materials from the Environmental Security Working Group on reforms in the environmental and climate spheres.

The Draft Ukraine Plan identifies five sectors with the greatest potential for accelerating economic growth: energy, agriculture, transportation, critical raw materials, and IT. It also identifies crosssectoral areas and cross-cutting principles for Ukraine's recovery and further reforms. This is Ukraine's transition to a green, digital, and inclusive economy. As stated in the document, the green transition is also crucial in the recovery and reconstruction architecture and will generally guide future investments envisioned in the plan, with a comprehensive "build back better" approach. A separate chapter is devoted to the green transition and environmental protection (Chapter 15, Section 2), which identifies the reforms under Component I of the Ukraine Facility: prevention, reduction, and control of industrial pollution; climate policy reform; introducing market-based carbon pricing mechanisms; restoring and preserving natural resources; and promoting sustainable production and consumption patterns in Ukraine (circular economy).

There is a tendency to recognize the principles of "building back better" and "building back greener" as an integral basis for Ukraine's further recovery and development. Increasingly, these approaches are reflected in sectoral and thematic recovery planning <u>processes</u>:

In the draft **Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027**, one of the three strategic goals is developing a united nation, including in the environmental dimension, and the priorities of regional development before 2027 include restoring and developing infrastructure based on the principles of transparency, accountability, sustainability, inclusion, energy efficiency, climate change adaptation, resilience to security threats, and economic feasibility. The draft strategy is rather general in nature, although its details are presented in <u>Annex 2</u> "Operational goals and objectives supporting the achievement of strategic goals";

The draft **Strategy of Ukraine for Innovations 2030** declares the principle of sustainable development (compliance of all measures of the country's innovation development with the Sustainable Development Goals national system of targets and indicators) among the principles of government policy in the field of innovation. The draft strategy recognizes that the innovations that are critical to rebuilding and supporting Ukraine's transformation process include modern, fast, environmentally-friendly reconstruction of infrastructure and housing, taking into account both green trends and smart city technologies and urbanization processes.

However, it is too early to say that Ukraine has introduced a systematic and comprehensive consideration of the green component in developing sectoral planning documents.

Ukrainian legislation establishes requirements to consider certain environmental considerations in local recovery and reconstruction planning documents. In particular, comprehensive recovery programs for a region or a territorial community (or part thereof) should promote sustainable urban mobility, energy efficiency, and environmental friendliness, and should be consistent with the Sustainable Development Goals of Ukraine 2030. These programs should contain a section that identifies reasonable proposals for environmental restoration, conservation, and development of protected areas and sites, as well as a section that reflects general POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

approaches and proposals for comprehensive restoration and development of the region's territory and measures for implementation, taking into account the rules and regulations on spatial planning and use, environmental and natural resource protection, etc. The practice of implementing these requirements exists (for example, in <u>Kyiv</u> Oblast), however it requires additional research with regard to the content of these documents in terms of the presence of environmental components and their cross-cutting nature.

1.4 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

From the very beginning, CSOs have been insisting on Ukraine's green recovery and including environmental and climate components in all planning documents (national, sectoral, thematic, regional, and local). The public sector advocates for the principles of "building back better" and "building back greener" not only through its own initiatives, but also through CSO efforts to engage in the political processes of national and local governments. This practice is not always successful.

The materials for the draft **Action Plan for Post-War Reconstruction and Development of Ukraine** were developed by working groups that included CSO and expert community representatives. However, the working group participants themselves expressed *reservations* about civil society's lack of awareness and integration when developing the materials of the National Recovery Council's working groups and their subsequent discussion, and pointed to the need to include environmental and climate components as crosscutting reforms in Ukraine's post-war recovery.

The process of drafting the **Ukraine Plan**, and consultations had its own nuances. Section 3, Chapter 2 of the draft Ukraine Plan describes the process of consultations with stakeholders. It is worth noting that the main focus was on involving business representatives in developing the Ukraine Plan, and the format of submitting proposals thereto was business-oriented. Separate meetings were held with regional administrations, local governments, and public organization representatives. Nevertheless, the process of collecting proposals and taking them into account was vague and unclear. The new **Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027** was drafted with the broad participation of stakeholders, including the public, and a strategic environmental assessment of the project is underway. In total, more than 3,000 *proposals* were submitted in various ways, which really shows that the strategy update is an example of successful work with experts and the public.

The public is also involved in discussing sectoral or thematic strategies. For example, in the fall, a strategic environmental assessment of the new **National Waste Management Plan 2033** was launched, and public consultations are underway. In 2023, *public discussions* were held on the **Strategy for Thermal Modernization of Buildings in Ukraine 2050**, the State Targeted Economic Program for Supporting Thermal Modernization of Buildings 2030, and the Operational Action Plan 2024-2026. The documents were adopted in early 2024. Separate consultations were held as part of drafting of the elements of the National Energy and Climate Plan.

Lawmakers provided for public involvement in preparing **regional and local planning documents** and rebuilding and recovery of regions and territorial communities. At the same time, the degree of public involvement varies and depends on the type of planning document. In particular, the <u>Law "On the Regulation of Urban</u> <u>Development"</u> provides for adopting programs for the comprehensive rebuilding of a region or a territorial community, and prohibits adopting the documents without a public discussion of drafts. A special <u>procedure</u> was introduced that defines the mechanism for public discussion.

The *Law "On the Principles of State Regional Policy"* included regional development strategies and territorial community development strategies (and their action plans) to the category of regional and local planning documents. The law no longer provides for an obligation but rather an opportunity to involve public associations in developing documents. This shortcoming has been partially addressed by a *procedure* that provides for public discussion in the drafting of regional development strategies. There are no such legally binding requirements for territorial community development strategies (only *methodological recommendations* are available). In practice, this leads to sporadic public involvement in the drafting of community development strategies, and the dependence of public involvement on the will of community leaders. Experts have already *drawn attention* to this shortcoming.

CSOs are involved in developing relevant community recovery and reconstruction planning documents, providing practical assistance to communities in training and developing relevant documents, e.g., NGO <u>Spilno HUB</u>, <u>Recovery and Development Agency</u>, <u>Cedos</u>, and <u>Center</u> for Economic Strategy.

SECTION 2

INTERNATIONAL PROCESSES FOR POST-WAR RECOVERY

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

SECTION 2. INTERNATIONAL PROCESSES FOR POST-WAR RECOVERY

International planning processes and discussions of Ukraine's post-war recovery have an important and special role: they ensure the involvement and coordination of Ukraine's international partners. The government of Ukraine and international partners are interested in maintaining a dialogue at different levels and in different formats.

2.1 OVERVIEW OF THE PROCESSES

A) OVERARCHING INTERNATIONAL PROCESSES

CONFERENCES ON UKRAINE'S RECOVERY

One of the key international processes for planning post-war recovery is the **Ukraine Recovery Conferences** (URC). The first conference was held on July 4-5, 2022, in Lugano, Switzerland. It was, in fact, the beginning of the international process of post-war recovery

in Ukraine. In 2023, the <u>UK</u> hosted it, with an agenda focused on mobilizing international support for Ukraine's economic and social stabilization and the subsequent recovery process from the effects of the war,including through emergency assistance for immediate needs and financing for private sector participation in the recovery process. The next conference is scheduled for 2024 in Berlin. Its <u>priorities</u> will be "Business Dimension" (private sector mobilization), "Human Dimension" (social recovery and human capital), "Local and Regional Dimension" (EU accession and related reforms).

G7/INTERNATIONAL DONOR COORDINATION PLATFORM

The Multi-Agency Donor Coordination Platform for Ukraine was established in accordance with the decision of the G7 leaders on December 12, 2022, and the Steering Committee was established in January 2023. The Steering Committee is <u>co-chaired</u> by Ukraine, the U.S. and EU: Sergii Marchenko, Minister of Finance of Ukraine; Dalip Singh, U.S. Deputy National Advisor for International Economics; and Gert Jan Koopman, Director General of the European Commission's Directorate-General for Neighborhood Policy and Enlargement Negotiations. In addition, the platform's <u>website</u> was released in 2023. The Steering Committee held seven meetings in 2023. At the <u>seventh</u> meeting, it was stated that "the mission of the Platform in 2024 is to mobilize external budget support to ensure economic sustainability and social protection of the population."

<u>The platform's mandate</u> is to coordinate support for Ukraine's immediate financial needs, future economic recovery and reconstruction from various sources, and established financing instruments, complementing existing aid, in particular, the G7 Finance Track, G7+ Energy Sector Assistance Coordination Group, and the International Financial Institution (IFI) Coordination Group. The goal is also to channel resources in a consistent, transparent, and comprehensive manner.

INTERNATIONAL WORKING GROUP ON THE ENVIRONMENTAL CONSEQUENCES OF WAR

In 2023, the International Working Group on the Environmental **Consequences of War** was established, co-chaired by Andriy Yermak, Head of the Office of the President of Ukraine, and Margot Wallström, former Deputy Prime Minister and former Minister of Foreign Affairs of Sweden. In its statement, the group outlined three main areas of work: assessing the environmental damage caused by the war, holding Russia accountable for environmental crimes and compensating for environmental damage, and planning for Ukraine's green environmental recovery and rebuilding through the transition to a green economy. The group confirmed this approach during the international conference "United for Justice. United for Nature" in Kyiv on October 20-21, 2023. During the conference, the Minister of Environmental Protection and Natural Resources of Ukraine presented a draft international environmental declaration that emphasizes international support for Ukraine throughout the process of its sustainable recovery and reconstruction.

The international group operates in the format of regular meetings, among other things. The *first high-level meeting* was held on June 29, 2023, where the group presented a statement on its activities and areas of support to the Ukrainian authorities. The *fifth meeting* was held on January 8, 2024, where they discussed, among other things, work on the *Environmental Compact for Ukraine*, which includes 50 recommendations (presented in February 2024); one of the priorities is "Green Reconstruction and Environmental Recovery."

CONFERENCE ON GREEN RECOVERY OF UKRAINE

On November 28 – December 1, 2023, the *International Conference* on Ukraine's Green Recovery was held in Vilnius. Participants discussed future challenges, strategies, and concrete solutions in support of green recovery and proposals and approaches for green recovery and rebuilding of Ukraine. The conference addressed issues related to the status, challenges, and opportunities for green recovery in Ukraine, but no specific policy decisions were made.

The conference consisted of two segments: the first two days were dedicated to the political segment of recovery, and the next two days to the business segment. The political segment focused on recovery issues and opportunities for green recovery, presented the main measures to support Ukraine and its green recovery, informed about the progress and first results of the New European Bauhaus, and discussed the role of Ukrainian municipalities in rebuilding Ukraine. However, the political segment lacked a separate session that would holistically and comprehensively reflect strategic approaches to green recovery and reconstruction in Ukraine. The business segment addressed the role of business and the importance of the circular economy in Ukraine's green recovery and reconstruction.

B) INTERNATIONAL ASSISTANCE AND COOPERATION

In 2022-2023, restructured loans from the European Investment Bank (EIB), European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD), and World Bank were the <u>main source of financing</u> for recovery, with a small share coming from grants from the U.S., Japan, and Germany, mostly through technical assistance projects or relevant development agencies, such as USAID, UNDP, the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), and German Society for International Development (GIZ). In 2023, UAH 21 billion (about \$552 million) was allocated for local and regional recovery projects, where almost half were EIB loans, and the rest were funds from the Liquidation Fund (assets of the Russian Federation seized in Ukraine).

WORLD BANK

Since February 2022, the World Bank Group has mobilized more than \$38 billion in financial support for Ukraine. As of December 5, 2023, more than \$30 billion of it had already been disbursed to Ukraine. More than 90% of funding was provided by development <u>donors</u> (the U.S., UK, Japan, Norway, and others) to finance specific programs, including the <u>Public Expenditures for Administrative Capacity Endurance Project</u> (PEACE), which has the largest share of \$23.4 billion, the <u>Ukraine Relief</u>, <u>Recovery, Reconstruction and Reform Trust Fund</u> (URTF), and others.

In addition to providing assistance for immediate needs (support to the government and government institutions, energy system, healthcare system, etc.), the World Bank is one of Ukraine's key partners in planning for future recovery. The World Bank Group, the European Commission, and the United Nations (UN) have already prepared three Rapid Damage and Recovery Needs Assessments (RDNAs). The second assessment, <u>RDNA2</u>, was conducted in coordination with humanitarian and development partners, academia, CSOs, and the private sector, and provides a comprehensive assessment of the impact of the war in 20 sectors, as well as the funding needs to mitigate the impacts.

OTHER INTERNATIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

In 2023, the **International Monetary Fund** (IMF) continued to provide regular and key support to Ukraine's macrofinancial sector. In particular, in March, a <u>special mechanism</u> for Ukraine was approved under the Extended Fund Facility (EFF), which contains clear provisions on the importance of creating a framework for a green transition and green post-war growth. In December 2023, the <u>second implementation review</u> was carried out, which, in particular, noted low progress in the green transition. Overall, the IMF believes that Ukraine has significant <u>potential</u> to implement policies that would internalize climate considerations. The IMF's modeling suggests that is possible to gradually increase the CO₂ tax to \$50/t by 2035.

The EIB has a special role in financing projects with EU funds. It currently runs two programs in Ukraine: Ukraine Solidarity Urgent Response for energy and critical infrastructure and the EU for Ukraine Fund (the first project to support small and medium-sized businesses was approved in December 2023).

In early 2023, the EIB released a <u>report</u> on the results of a study on Ukraine's recovery strategy, conducted by the Boston Consulting Group and commissioned by the EIB. The report proposes a number of principles, priority projects, and criteria for prioritizing reconstruction projects, including a number of climate and environmental ones. However, the top 25 most important initiatives (projects) include only one that can be directly considered green: modernizing water supply and wastewater infrastructure.

The EBRD plays an important role in financing projects. Since February 2022, the bank's financing in Ukraine <u>has amounted</u> to more than \$3 billion, including liquidity support for the railways,

energy companies, and support for Naftogaz, as well as participation in the grain corridor. The EBRD is the *largest* institutional investor in Ukraine and supports a green post-war recovery.

The Nordic Environment Finance Corporation (*NEFCO*) is perhaps the only financial institution with a major strategic objective to support Ukraine's <u>green</u> post-war recovery. Ukraine's Green Post-War Recovery Program was launched in July 2022.

EUROPEAN UNION

The EU is definitely a key partner of Ukraine. <u>Support</u> from the EU and its member states has already amounted to about €48 billion since February 2022 (excluding military aid) and covers almost all areas of life, as well as direct budget support. The role of EU assistance cannot be overestimated.

On June 20, 2023, the European Commission proposed creating a new mechanism to support Ukraine, the Ukraine Facility, in the amount of €50 billion for 2024-2027. The mechanism was designed to streamline and integrate all EU assistance (except military) in close cooperation with EU member states, European financial institutions, and international partners, in particular, through the Multilateral Coordination Platform.

The draft regulation on the Ukraine Facility proposed by the European Commission includes <u>three main pillars</u>:

Area 1: Supporting Ukraine Recovery Plan

- Area 2: Framework for investing in Ukraine
- Area 3: Assistance programs

The EU is currently providing support through many different programs. In particular, support for the recovery and reconstruction of communities through a number of projects and programs that are the international community's contribution to assisting not only the Ukrainian authorities in promoting the necessary reforms, but also implementing initiatives in specific communities. For example, the **New European Bauhaus** (NEB) is implementing the project Actions for Ukraine, which is organized in three pilot areas.

<u>Urgent need for housing</u>, developing possible model solutions to meet the urgent housing needs of internally displaced persons (IDPs) in Ukraine and Ukrainian refugees in the EU, and in addition, to compare alternative solutions and provide recommendations to the relevant public authorities;

<u>Circular housing</u>, which involves promoting the preparation of sustainable design and engineering for Ukraine's reconstruction by collecting potential solutions for recycling and reusing demolished buildings and infrastructure and researching methods of circular construction using Ukrainian resources;

<u>Capacity building</u>, creating a system of trainings for local governments in Ukraine with a focus on the early return of refugees to Ukraine to avoid brain drain and labor shortages in Ukraine in the long term, as well as directing support to the recovery of Ukraine's economy, giving preference to options that can be implemented by Ukrainians, creating jobs, improving workforce skills, and adapting the industrial ecosystem in Ukraine.

A number of programs are implemented by the EU jointly with other parties. For example, Ukraine - Local Empowerment, Accountability and Development (U-LEAD) with Europe is a cooperation program between the Ukrainian government, the EU, and EU member states Germany, Poland, Denmark, and Slovenia. Implemented by the German state-owned company GIZ, the program's goal is to strengthen the capacity of key stakeholders at the national, regional, and local levels to empower local governance in communities, including in times of war and reconstruction. The program has regional offices in all the regions of Ukraine and supports territorial communities in completing decentralization reforms; assists communities adapt to war conditions, both in communities where war-related destruction has occurred and in communities that have not suffered such destruction; planning, coordinating, and implementing reconstruction measures (e.g., retaining local businesses and attracting new investors, developing new businesses, promoting sustainable green practices, and transitioning to eco community development). U-LEAD with Europe is implementing the "Strengthening Local Resilience: Support for *Emergency Repairs in Communities"* initiative, which provides assistance to 100 communities that have suffered serious damage as a result of Russia's aggression.

UN

UNDP in Ukraine has been implementing a wide range of activities to support Ukraine's post-war recovery. Following Russia's full-scale invasion in 2022, UNDP launched a special <u>Resilience and Recovery</u> <u>Program</u> for Ukraine to support the Government in its emergency response, fulfill its obligations to provide public services, and support the economy. It has five areas of support:

The Government's ability to respond to and resolve crises; Continuous provision of public services;

Emergency work that contributes to recovery and reconstruction; Income, livelihoods, and support for the private sector; Civil society and support for the social fabric.

In 2023, UNDP actively created <u>"recovery offices"</u> (community recovery and development centers) and implemented energy, education, and other projects. Overall, UNDP supports Ukraine's <u>green</u> post-war recovery.

In addition, under other programs (including <u>energy and</u> <u>environment</u>), UNDP is implementing a number of projects in the areas of green recovery, energy efficiency, and climate change.

Other UN agencies and offices, including the UN Office in Ukraine, are also active. For example, the <u>Ukrainian Community Recovery</u> <u>Fund</u> is managed by the UN Office in Ukraine, and the priorities are set in cooperation with the Ministry for Development of Communities, Territories and Infrastructure of Ukraine. At its first meeting on December 22, 2023, the Steering Committee of the <u>Ukrainian Communities Recovery Fund</u> approved allocating \$4.6 million to support communities in Sumy Oblast for agricultural development and economic resilience. The community projects should begin in March 2024.

COOPERATION WITH INDIVIDUAL COUNTRIES

The United States is the *leader* in security assistance to Ukraine. Since February 2022 alone, it has amounted to about \$44 billion.

In September 2023, Penny Pritzker was *appointed* Special Representative for Ukraine's Economic Recovery.

Much of the U.S. assistance (particularly in the non-military sphere) is provided through the U.S. Agency for International Development (*USAID*), whose substantive activities in Ukraine are usually planned in consultation with selected CSOs. The agency's activities in Ukraine cover a wide range of issues from direct budget support to sectoral assistance in a number of areas. Since the beginning of the full-scale war on February 24, 2022, USAID has *provided* \$9.88 billion in development and humanitarian assistance.

The UK has been one of the leaders in comprehensive support for Ukraine since the beginning of Russia's aggression. In 2023, the next Ukraine Recovery Conference (*URC-2023*) was organized in London, where an important priority was to engage the private sector in rebuilding Ukraine and create the conditions for it. Unlike previous URCs, the London conference provided a fairly broad opportunity for civil society participation (but business had a much broader opportunity to contribute to the discussions).

In early 2024, the UK and Ukraine signed a <u>security agreement</u>, which, in addition to the security component (which is certainly the <u>main</u> one), also contains priorities for cooperating in Ukraine's reconstruction and post-war recovery. Unfortunately, the agreement's provisions on these issues do not mention green or sustainable rebuilding.

Germany is one of the main partners providing *military* and other assistance to Ukraine. Since February 2022, assistance from Germany has *totaled* almost \in 28 billion, including contributions to European funds and programs. Part of this aid is directly related to environmental and, especially, climate issues. In particular, a number of *environmental and climate* projects are being implemented through the state-owned company GIZ. The *Climate Office* was established with support from one of these projects. Germany launched a *platform to support* Ukraine's reconstruction, which aims to facilitate contacts and exchange experience between companies, municipalities, civil society, and research organizations, as well as by providing information on consultation, cooperation, and funding opportunities. Currently, the website contains only general information about international processes of rebuilding Ukraine.

The reconstruction of Ukraine is being actively discussed in **Poland**, **Finland**, and other countries. This is primarily due to the interest of businesses and governments in participating in the reconstruction process.

In **Poland**, the Warsaw Enterprise Institute is doing a lot of work in this area. In addition to a special <u>report</u> on Poland's participation in Ukraine's reconstruction, they also launched a special online <u>service</u> on its reconstruction. The Polish Service for the Rebuilding of Ukraine is a project supporting rebuilding and modernizing Ukraine through economic development by attracting Polish companies to Ukraine and supporting Polish-Ukrainian economic cooperation.

In **Finland**, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Employment, the Ministry of Finance, and interested Finnish business representatives developed a <u>Plan for Finnish</u> <u>Participation in the Reconstruction of Ukraine</u>, focusing on financing and advisory services for Finnish companies to participate in the large-scale project of rebuilding Ukraine in terms of funding and project duration. The second part of the plan, to be developed in 2024, will focus on Finnish public authorities and all stakeholders participating in Ukraine's reconstruction, as well as on using Finnish development cooperation funds in Ukraine.

As noted above, **Denmark** is actively involved in responding to the consequences of the war, being the *first* to contribute to the new Fund for the Rebuilding of Ukrainian Communities and providing direct support to Mykolaiv Oblast. In 2023, Denmark provided a total of $\leq 103.2 \text{ million}$ in reconstruction assistance.

In practice, in addition to the above-mentioned countries, a large number of other countries provide assistance on a bilateral basis: the Baltic states, Canada, Japan, Australia, and many others.

2.2 STAKEHOLDERS

In 2023, **international political processes and international organizations** mainly considered the government as a whole and the private sector as the main stakeholders (in particular, the URC and the Vilnius Conference on Green Recovery of Ukraine), and partially focused on communities (especially cities). In the private sector, the focus was on large energy, agricultural, and transportation companies.

Large international private financial (investment) companies are an important stakeholder. In particular, the Warsaw Enterprise Institute and a number of <u>other</u> players noted that the American companies <u>BlackRock</u> and JP Morgan would be playing a <u>"fundamental"</u> role in Ukraine's reconstruction.

Development assistance programs (GIZ, USAID, UNDP, etc.) often view individual ministries and agencies as independent stakeholders (e.g., the Ministry of Environment, Ministry of Energy, Ministry of Reconstruction).

At the level of **bilateral cooperation**, countries often viewed local communities in Ukraine as the main stakeholder. At the same time, a number of countries saw their own private sector as an important stakeholder (in terms of ensuring its participation in Ukraine's reconstruction).

The EU considers civil society, the private sector, and local authorities to be the main stakeholders in the **Ukraine Facility** mechanism. For the purposes of the Ukraine Plan, the government identified central executive bodies, regional groups, business sector groups, civil society groups, and members of parliament as the main stakeholders.

It should also be added that in all international processes, the **President of Ukraine and the Office of the President of Ukraine** play a significant role and should be considered a key stakeholder in recovery planning.

2.3 GREENING THE PROCESSES

All international political processes (URC, G7, etc.) support green post-war recovery. For example, in May 2023, a G7 joint statement <u>declared</u> support for "sustainable and resilient post-war recovery and green reconstruction of Ukraine." During the London Conference, there were also a number of statements with such emphases, especially from the Ukrainian government.

In general, international financial institutions' work takes into account the needs of green recovery. As noted above, the IMF's Extended Fund Facility contains clear provisions on the importance of creating the foundations for a green transition and green post-war growth. To a large extent, EBRD and the EIB work takes environmental considerations on Ukraine's reconstruction into account. At the same time, the comprehensive assessment of reconstruction needs periodically prepared with World Bank participation includes only some "green" sectors (water supply and sewerage, forestry).

Regulation 2024/792 on the Ukraine Facility contains a number of provisions on the environmental and climate principles using funds under this mechanism. The provisions define environmental and climate goals, principles, and conditions for providing funds, especially under the first two elements of the Ukraine Facility (the Ukraine Plan and the Investment Facility). At the same time, their practical application is limited to "the extent possible in a context of war." For example, the overall goals of the Ukraine Facility include overcoming the environmental consequences of Russia's aggression, promoting environmental sustainability, and approximation to EU environmental and climate legislation and standards.

At least 20% of investments, both under the second investment element of the Ukraine Facility and the Ukraine Plan, must contribute "as far as possible in a country devastated by war" to climate change mitigation and adaptation, environmental protection (including biodiversity conservation), and a green transition.

Ukraine's plan should contribute to achieving the Ukraine Facility's goals, including the sustainable recovery and rebuilding of Ukraine; transition to a green, sustainable, digital, and inclusive economy; and fulfilling and complying with the nationally determined contribution under the Paris Agreement and obligations under

the Convention on Biological Diversity. The measures included in it must comply "as far as possible in the context of post-war reconstruction and recovery," with the principle of "doing no significant harm."

International organizations, such as UNDP, strongly support green recovery and take its needs into account in their work.

Ukraine's bilateral cooperation with individual countries, especially in regard to local projects, is also based on the needs of green recovery. In our opinion, this is a result of both the demand from communities and the priorities of the respective countries. This is especially true for Germany, Denmark, and Finland. However, we were unable to identify greening as a priority or cross-cutting issue in <u>USAID's</u> work.

2.4 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

In contrast to Lugano, the **London URC** was more open to public participation, which was ensured by thorough systematic efforts. However, the public continued to be an observer rather than a participant. Instead, a significant role was given to business. The Green Recovery Conference of Ukraine (in Vilnius) provided some opportunities for public participation, but the private sector had much greater opportunities for effective participation.

The Multi-Agency Donor Coordination Platform for Ukraine works closely with Ukrainian authorities and IFIs and is currently virtually closed to the public.

The International Working Group on the Environmental Consequences of War held informal <u>meetings</u> with CSO representatives, including one in June 2023. Margot Wallström <u>spoke</u> at the international conference "United for Justice. United for Nature" and emphasized the importance of cooperation with Ukrainian environmental NGOs. During the conference, the International Group met with Ukrainian environmental NGOs to discuss Ukraine's green recovery and environment. At the same time, only a few organizations are currently directly involved in the work.

The World Bank was not very open in planning its programs in Ukraine, except for involving the expert potential of individual organizations.

Since the **Ukraine Facility** was formally established by adopting an EU regulation, its development was accompanied by standard European Commission public <u>consultations</u>. Unfortunately, only 21 comments (proposals) were received via these formal consultations, including only two from Ukraine. This may indicate that stakeholders in the EU and Ukraine use other, non-formal mechanisms to communicate their views to EU institutions.

Developing the **Ukraine Plan** involved a series of public consultations, which are described in the draft plan. In practical terms, most of the public consultations were aimed at engaging businesses.

UNDP and other **UN** agencies in Ukraine do not involve the public in planning their activities, and there is no public oversight over their activities.

In general, international and bilateral cooperation between Ukraine and its partners is without the non-governmental sector's wide involvement in planning the main cooperation programs. Virtually, accountability and in particular anti-corruption measures are the only topics where there is a dialog. This is likely due to the fact that the vast majority of such cooperation focuses on providing assistance to address immediate needs. Given the role of IFIs, the transparency of their work in post-war reconstruction is a particularly acute issue.

SECTION 3

INSTITUTIONAL AND ORGANIZATIONAL RECOVERY PROCESSES

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024



44 / 82

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

SECTION 3. INSTITUTIONAL AND ORGANIZATIONAL RECOVERY PROCESSES

Ukraine established a number of organizational and institutional mechanisms for planning and implementing recovery (rebuilding) from the consequences of armed aggression. These mechanisms are highly centralized in the work of public authorities.

3.1 DESCRIPTION OF THE PROCESSES

A) GOVERNMENTAL LEVEL

In December 2022, the Ministry of Communities, Territories and Infrastructure was created by merging the Ministry of Infrastructure and the Ministry of Communities and Territorial Development, followed by creating the position of Vice Prime Minister for the Recovery of Ukraine – Minister of Communities, Territorial and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine (currently held by Oleksandr Kubrakov). In 2023, the CMU introduced the positions of <u>deputy ministers</u> or deputy heads of oblast state administrations, with the competence to rebuild the regions, territories, and infrastructure (or to assign the relevant powers to another deputy in certain ministries and oblast state administrations). In the same decision, the CMU also set forth a list of ministries where the positions were created:

Ministry of Infrastructure Ministry of Defense Ministry of Health Ministry of Education and Science Ministry of Energy Ministry of Digital Transformation Ministry of Culture Ministry of Social Policy

As we can see, the Ministry of Environmental Protection is not on this list, which may indicate that recovery in the environmental sphere (in particular, protected areas and environmental infrastructure) is not a priority.

B) RECOVERY AGENCY

In accordance with previously announced plans, at the end of February 2023, the Government <u>established</u> the State Agency for the Restoration and Development of Infrastructure of Ukraine (Recovery Agency), based on the government road agency Ukravtodor. Formally, the Recovery Agency's tasks do not include special powers in terms of recovery from the consequences of Russia's aggression. However, in <u>practice</u>, a significant part of its activities is related to preventing or eliminating the consequences of Russia's armed aggression on the basis of relevant special CMU resolutions. For example, the agency has been <u>working</u> on a water supply project using the Karachunivskyi Reservoir since the early days after the Kakhovka Hydroelectric Power Plant (HPP) was blown up, erecting protective structures for <u>energy</u> facilities with the support of USAID, etc.

C) DREAM

In 2023, the *Digital Restoration Ecosystem for Accountable Management* (DREAM) was developed by the Ministry of Infrastructure, the Recovery Agency, and the *DREAM Project Office*, which was established on the basis of an Open Contracting Partnership with support from Transparency International Ukraine and the Better Regulation Delivery Office (BRDO), in close cooperation with civil society and international partners. It was first presented at the London Recovery Conference, and in November 2023, beta testing of the updated functionality *started*. In November 2023, the platform made its data available through an *API*, which makes it much friendlier for public use.

DREAM is a government electronic platform that collects, organizes, and publishes open data at all stages of restoration projects in real time. The system is currently being developed and improved.

D) THE FUND FOR RECOVERY FROM THE CONSEQUENCES OF AGGRESSION

The Law on the State Budget of Ukraine 2023 established a special state budget fund for eliminating the consequences of Russia's armed aggression, including humanitarian, social, and economic. In February 2023, the *procedure* for using the funds was approved.

Financing operations from the recovery fund <u>began</u> in May 2023 with the allocation of UAH 4.4 billion to pay compensation under the <u>eVidnovnlenya</u> (e-recovery) project, a government program that can Ukrainian citizens can use to rebuild damaged housing as a result of Russia's armed aggression.

E) PATRONAGE OVER THE REGIONS

The President of Ukraine proposed a special format at the Lugano URC, the patronage of partner countries over reconstruction of individual cities or regions. Initially, many countries <u>expressed</u> a desire to participate in rebuilding Ukrainian cities: Italy to

Rivne, Germany to Chernihiv, Belgium to Mykolaiv, Sweden and the Netherlands to Kherson, and Denmark to Mykolaiv Oblast.

In 2023, this approach had <u>mixed</u> results, which Ekonomichna Pravda tried to summarize. After some reflection, some countries concluded that this format was not the best for them. For example, in April 2023, Jochen Flasbart, the German government's commissioner for Ukraine's recovery, said that he did not consider the concept of donor states focusing on rebuilding certain regions during post-war recovery to be effective.

At the same time, Denmark effectively used the proposed mandate and "adopted" Mykolaiv Oblast. Since the beginning of the full-scale war, the country has provided €375 million in civilian aid. Denmark is helping to purify water; purchase equipment for water, electricity, and heat supply; repair buildings and sewage systems; and carry out emergency work. Denmark's support has already moved on to the next stage, i.e., restoring physical and social infrastructure, as well as basic necessities. In fall 2023, Ambassador of the Kingdom of Denmark to Ukraine Ole Egberg Mikkelsen said, "For example, a few weeks ago, I visited Mykolaiv and handed over garbage trucks. What do garbage trucks have to do with Danish-Ukrainian relations? If there are no garbage trucks, there is no recovery, and people will not return to Mykolaiv... There are so many conferences about rebuilding and recovery, but not enough attention is paid to concrete things. I don't like conferences. We need to act. We can't wait for peace and a grand reconstruction plan. We have to start now."

3.2 STAKEHOLDERS

In terms of institutional and organizational processes, the main stakeholders are currently individual ministries, regional administrations, and communities. The ministries are primarily those that have deputy ministers in charge of post-war reconstruction: Ministry of Recovery, Ministry of Defense, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Energy, Ministry of Digital Transformation, Ministry of Culture, and Ministry of Social Policy.

Although the public is considered a stakeholder and shows interest in these mechanisms, so far only the Ministry of Recovery and some oblast military administrations have taken steps to take their interests into account.

3.3 GREENING THE PROCESSES

At the governmental level, environmental issues have not received a role in the institutional and organizational architecture of postwar reconstruction. The Ministry of Environment does not have a deputy minister for post-war reconstruction.

In fall 2023, the Ministry of Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development <u>approved</u> guidelines for prioritizing projects to address the consequences of Russia's armed aggression, which apply to all reconstruction projects. The document officially approves the methodology, which was <u>developed</u> taking into account recommendations from World Bank experts and NGOs, members of Ukraine's Reconstruction, Integrity, Sustainability, and Efficiency Coalition (RISE Ukraine). It was used to select projects for funding from the Liquidation Fund.

The guidelines feature a list of indices, criteria, and indicators that allow for prioritizing projects based on a scoring system. Interestingly, the guidelines use a number of environmental criteria, including climate change criteria. There is a <u>separate list</u> of work sectors and eligible operation types that are considered universally consistent with the goals of the Paris Agreement.

Currently, the DREAM database includes about 1,500 projects being prepared or implemented, but a significant number of them are not related to post-war reconstruction. The projects' sectors (sectoral priorities) include some green components (water, sanitation, waste, renewable energy), but do not include environmental protection measures (in particular, recovery of nature reserves or other nature protection measures), climate change adaptation, emission reduction, etc. A significant drawback of the system is the lack of any information on the environmental sustainability of projects (during the test period, there was an intention to include such information in the project description).

In general, the Recovery Agency's activities in 2023 were *entirely* focused on restoring and protecting critical infrastructure. In the context of green issues, the agency's only (however very complex and important) project in 2023 was constructing a main water pipeline to provide 1.5 million people with drinking water after the Kakhovka HPP was destroyed.

3.4 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

None of the institutional and organizational processes we have identified contain special mechanisms for public participation in planning or implementing post-war reconstruction (recovery).

However, the <u>eDem</u> module is being developed within the DREAM framework to ensure public participation, which will become one of the DREAM system's key components, initiated by the Center for Innovation Development with assistance from RISE Ukraine. For the purposes of developing this module, a special <u>study</u> was conducted on public participation tools in the recovery process.

SECTION 4

KEY TRENDS IN 2023

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

POLICY PAPER - JANUARY - FEBRUARY 2024



POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

SECTION 4. KEY TRENDS IN 2023

4.1 CHANGES COMPARED TO 2022

NATIONAL PLANNING PROCESSES FOR POST-WAR RECONSTRUCTION

In 2023, work was virtually curtailed on drafting and implementing the **National Plan for Postwar Reconstruction and Development of Ukraine**. After presenting a draft at the Lugano conference (where it apparently fulfilled its objective of convincing partners of the scale and complexity of post-war reconstruction), the plan suddenly lost any role as a tool for planning post-war reconstruction in the country.

The plan was never approved, which may be due to various factors: the need to implement certain measures immediately (such as constructing a water pipeline after the Kakhovka HPP was destroyed), organizational features of implementing measures to recover from the consequences of combat (in particular, the Recovery Agency's significant role), and the specifics of governance in wartime. In addition, the refusal to finalize and adopt a national recovery plan may be a sign of the lack of a coherent and effective system for longterm public policy planning in general. The absence of a national recovery plan does not mean that it should not exist. Nonetheless, the process of formulating and discussing the draft national post-war recovery plan was a unique experience for all stakeholders. It is obvious that a number of conceptual frameworks and approaches that emerged during its development are important for current and future planning processes. An example of an important outcome of the plan development process is the concept of "building back better," which has become firmly established in the public discourse and political stance of the authorities, partners, and other stakeholders.

In 2023, the role of the main instrument for national post-war recovery planning was unexpectedly assigned to the **Ukraine Plan** as a condition for receiving funds under the first pillar of the Ukraine Facility. Such a central role for the Ukraine Plan in the government planning architecture is indicated in the draft plan. On the one hand, this demonstrates the EU's consistent policy, which stated in spring 2022 that the EU should play a key role in coordinating post-war recovery. On the other hand, at the moment, the draft Ukraine Plan cannot be called a holistic approach to planning post-war reconstruction and development; its practical goal is rather pragmatic: to ensure that Ukraine can receive EU funding. Therefore, its practical impact on post-war recovery (including green recovery) can only be ensured through constant monitoring of the use of funds and evaluation. The relevant mechanisms are provided for in the Ukraine Facility regulation.

An important achievement in 2023 was finalizing the new **Regional Development Strategy**. Since the post-war recovery planning architecture should include coordination with and between sectoral strategies, updating one of the key development planning tools was a very important step. In addition, all sectoral strategies adopted or developed in 2023 take into account the need to overcome the consequences of hostilities. This trend is justified and necessary.

Non-governmental processes were mainly focused on creating platforms and opportunities for public participation in the processes related to planning and implementing post-war reconstruction. In particular in 2023, environmental organizations were looking for ways to lobby for green recovery, especially in international processes. CSOs' efforts to support communities in planning and implementing green post-war reconstruction can be considered successful, but there are still many gaps in national processes for both participating in and ensuring green post-war recovery.

In 2023, there was a **tendency to recognize the principle of "building back greener."** Certain elements of green recovery were integrated into the draft Ukraine Plan (in particular, transitioning to a green economy as a cross-cutting recovery principle), new regional development strategy 2021-2027, draft innovation strategy 2030, etc. However, it is too early to say that post-war reconstruction and recovery planning systematically takes into account an environmental or climate component. Despite political statements, there are reasonable doubts that in practice a green component plays an important or special role in national recovery planning processes.

INTERNATIONAL RECOVERY PLANNING PROCESSES

International conferences on Ukraine's post-war recovery (URC) continued to play an important role in ensuring dialogue with international partners and developing common approaches to post-war recovery. In 2023, the Multi-Agency Donor Coordination Platform for Ukraine began to play an active role, and private company financing and participation in post-war reconstruction played a significant role in the work of these processes.

In 2023, **international organizations** remained key players in providing and administering international financial and technical assistance, especially the World Bank, IMF, EIB, EBRD, and UNDP. At the same time, their role in post-war recovery planning is difficult to clearly define.

In 2023, **the EU** cemented its role as a key bilateral partner in planning and supporting Ukraine's post-war rebuilding and recovery. In this context, the Ukraine Facility is the main instrument that has the potential to be a central element of the entire international architecture of assistance in Ukraine's post-war recovery.

In 2023, **bilateral cooperation** with individual countries became pragmatic, resulting in a large number of assistance and recovery programs being systematically implemented in Ukraine. The U.S., UK, and Germany have perhaps become Ukraine's main security and development partners, and German partners have a particular focus on green recovery (mainly in GIZ's work).

Other countries, given their relatively limited capacities, are involved in some recovery projects, especially at the local level. However, their role in post-war planning is currently limited. This can also be explained by some skepticism about the effectiveness of ongoing discussions and planning against the backdrop of a huge number of problems that need and can be solved today.

In 2023, a number of countries were concerned about **their companies' access to future reconstruction projects**, believing that large investment companies would play a major role in planning and administering future programs, such as Black Rock and JP Morgan.

In 2023, **all international processes contained elements of green recovery**. In practice, the EBRD, EIB, IMF, European Commission, and UNDP pay special attention to green topics. According to our observations, international partners' local projects tend to be more "green" than large programs. In particular, we did not find a systematic approach to promoting green recovery in USAID activities.

INSTITUTIONAL AND ORGANIZATIONAL PROCESSES

At the governmental level, several important steps were taken in 2023 to strengthen the institutional and organizational component of post-war reconstruction processes.

The Government introduced Deputy Minister positions (heads of oblast state administrations) in charge of rebuilding territories and infrastructure. At the ministerial level, the positions were created in the Ministry of Infrastructure (Ministry of Recovery), Ministry of Defense, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Energy, Ministry of Digital Transformation, and others. Unfortunately, no such position was created in the Ministry of Environment. Creating the State Agency for Reconstruction and Development was an important step in 2023. Together with the ministry, the agency essentially focused all organizational efforts to recover transportation, housing, and social infrastructure. Their efforts created DREAM, the state ecosystem and platform that collects and publishes data on recovery projects.

An important feature of 2023 was to practically test the idea of country patronage over regions, which was presented in Lugano. This approach showed mixed results: some countries rejected it (e.g., Germany), while others actively implemented it. Among the latter, the example of Denmark adopting Mykolaiv Oblast can be considered the most successful. According to the Danish ambassador to Ukraine, this approach allows moving from talk to action. Organizational and institutional processes in 2023 did not sufficiently integrate green topics. The only example of integrating them is the Ministry of Recovery and Development's methodological recommendations for prioritizing war recovery projects, which contain a list of environmental and climate factors that should be taken into account when prioritizing projects.

4.2 TOOLS FOR PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

International processes in 2023 did not ensure the adequate participation of stakeholders other than business. Some processes remained completely closed to the public (in particular, the international donor coordination platform). The London URC was much more open to CSO participation, but they were limited to an observer role (unlike business, which had the opportunity to directly participate in panel discussions). Most international aid processes did not take public opinion into account.

Formal procedures played a role in ensuring public participation. For example, the draft regulation on the Ukraine Facility was subject to public discussion, but Ukrainian NGOs virtually ignored it. This may indicate Ukrainian stakeholders' lack of trust or awareness about such procedures in the EU. In this context, it is worth mentioning that Ukrainian stakeholders, especially businesses, were once very active in the formal consultations on the draft regulation on the carbon border adjustment mechanism (CBAM), which may indicate that Ukrainian organizations prefer direct lobbying.

Formal procedures were also used in Ukraine when discussing drafts of relevant strategies or plans, local planning documents, etc.

At the same time, the draft Ukraine Plan underwent a special series of discussions, although business was clearly favored. Unfortunately, the government has not demonstrated openness even on the issue of publishing the final draft.

A different approach was used to develop the draft National Energy and Climate Plan: public participation was ensured through a series of special thematic discussions. In our opinion, the most effective approach to organizing public discussions was applied during the discussion of the draft new regional development strategy. The opportunity to submit proposals was provided in various ways – more than 3,000 proposals were submitted! However, the Ministry of Recovery actively encouraged the public to participate in discussions and submit proposals. This process definitely serves as the best example of public engagement in 2023.

In 2023, it became apparent that the organizational and institutional processes of recovery from the consequences of Russia's aggression will not include special mechanisms to ensure public participation. The only exception may be the DREAM system, one of the unfinished elements of which is the eDem module, which is being developed to engage the public.

4.3 CONCLUSIONS

The national architecture for planning post-war reconstruction and development is still being formed. The process of national planning in the form of a special action plan has been curtailed, with the Ukraine Plan under Ukraine Facility taking its place. Thus, as of early 2024, Ukraine lacks a unified strategy for post-war reconstruction and recovery.

Sectoral and local planning processes in Ukraine have begun to take into account the needs of post-war reconstruction, which is not only a need but also an obvious necessity. In the coming years, this will likely extend to all areas of sectoral and local development planning.

International post-war reconstruction planning processes already have a decisive influence on the priorities and directions of recovery and development, which will continue, although they are characterized by a low level of transparency. International and bilateral cooperation between Ukraine and its partners is without the civil society sector's broad involvement during the planning stage for the main cooperation programs, and often not during the implementation stage. Given widespread concerns about the future role of large investment companies in Ukraine's post-war recovery, the absence of "international" recovery plan(s) in the public domain is troubling. In particular, their absence in the public space does not mean that Ukraine's main international partners do not have such plans (strategies). So far, only the EU has approved its strategic vision on this issue, the Ukraine Facility.

CSOs tend to cooperate with local authorities on specific postwar recovery projects. This is likely due to the greater openness of local authorities to cooperation and the smaller size of the projects.

From a political point of view, both the Ukrainian government and international partners agree that Ukraine's reconstruction should take into account environmental and climate issues. However, in practice, only a few international partners are implementing this approach in their programs and projects in Ukraine. The real "greenness" of funding under the Ukraine Facility will largely depend on the EU's political will and on properly monitoring the regulation's implementation.

In addition, stakeholders (i.e., government, partners, the public, business, and local authorities) have not yet formed a clear understanding of green recovery. In addition to general statements about "green recovery" and the need to take into account climate and environmental issues, public discourse in 2023 did not contain a structured and substantive discussion of the concept of green recovery. Unfortunately, the principle of "build back better and greener" remains unused and there have been few efforts to build a common understanding of its meaning.

It is likely that the lack of a substantive dialogue within a clear process (which would give participants a sense of the importance and effectiveness of the dialogue) is prompting several stakeholders to implement green projects now. In terms of content, the projects usually deal with renewable energy sources (small solar stations, heat pumps) and implementing basic environmental practices and mechanisms (water supply, sewage, household waste collection, etc.). This practice shapes the appropriate understanding, especially at the local level, of the concept of "green recovery", fragmenting and narrowing its content to individual, rather primitive (or basic) components in terms of strategic vision.

Previous <u>research</u> analyzed the processes of rebuilding Ukraine in 2022 and proposed a number of recommendations for national and

international processes in this area. They concerned the general principles of transparency and public participation in planning and implementing post-war reconstruction, public participation in international coordination and financial platforms, national processes, and public participation in and oversight of implementing the plan for Ukraine's recovery from the consequences of the war.

Some of these recommendations have been put into practice, in particular, in terms of transparency and public participation in sectoral reforms, e.g., in the drafting of a new version of the State Strategy for Regional Development 2021-2027, for which a wide range of stakeholders were consulted and involved. A number of discussions were initiated on climate issues, most of which took place in early 2024. For example, discussions of the draft National Energy and Climate Plan of Ukraine 2025-2030, the Law "On Fundamental Principles of State Climate Policy," and the Strategy for Drafting and Implementing State Climate Change Policy 2035. At the same time, public involvement in other sectoral policies remains insufficient. For example, there was no involvement during the development of the Energy Strategy of Ukraine 2050.

The recommendation to engage civil society throughout all stages of recovery and reconstruction, starting from the early stages, remains relevant. The government pays more attention to public involvement at the planning stage, in particular by announcing public discussions and public consultations. However, accountability and oversight tools are not sufficiently implemented. NGOs implement physical reconstruction measures and monitor financial flows for rebuilding Ukraine as part of grant projects, etc. At the same time, government agencies' reporting, monitoring, and evaluation obligations remain challenging.

Regardless of the level, the process of engagement continues to be formal. The reasons for this are not only the authorities' formal approach to holding various discussions and consultations, but also the lack of interest among the public. In view of this, the broad stakeholder engagement during the update of the State Strategy for Regional Development is rather positive.

The recommendation on transparency and public participation in international processes remains relevant and needs further implementation, and international partners should demonstrate leadership and goodwill in ensuring such principles of governance. IFIs remain untransparent in terms of public engagement. Other international processes at least recognize the importance of public engagement. The Multi-Agency Donor Coordination Platform for Ukraine created its own website. However, the webpage does not have sufficient information on financial flows aimed at assisting Ukraine, nor does it have the possibility of data processing, which hinders public awareness, effective monitoring, and oversight.

There is a tendency for international partners to cooperate and focus their attention on working with local communities and local NGOs. In particular, when it comes to implementing specific reconstruction projects in local communities and strengthening their capacity. NGOs promote initiatives aimed at specific local communities and strengthening their capacity. There are some developments in involving the public's analytical and expert potential, including on climate issues. International technical assistance projects play an important role here. However, it is too early to say that such cooperation is systemic and well spelled out.

Regardless of the extent of implementing the previously proposed recommendations on the principles of transparency and public participation in the processes of post-war recovery and rebuilding of Ukraine, or lack thereof, they remain relevant and require further implementation.

4.4 RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations for the post-war green recovery and rebuilding of Ukraine based on the principles of participatory democracy and civil society, which are cross-cutting and relevant to <u>all stakeholders</u>:

Ensure compliance with the principles of participatory democracy and "building back greener and better" **at all stages of Ukraine's recovery and reconstruction** – planning, implementing, monitoring, and oversight;

Transparency in ensuring public participation should be ensured when developing and elaborating the **entire system of planning documents** for reconstruction – national, sectoral, regional, and local;

Transparency and accessibility need to be ensured not only in the **national processes** of Ukraine's recovery and rebuilding, but also in **international processes**, while the latter remain closed to the public;

Strengthen key national and international stakeholders' cooperation with Ukrainian civil society on a systematic, well spelled out, and clearly defined basis, and **enhance the synergy** of efforts in rebuilding and restoring Ukraine;

Restore the consolidation of all stakeholders' efforts, which should be seen as a fundamental condition for Ukraine's post-war rebuilding and recovery. Consolidating the efforts of the entire society and state at the beginning of a full-scale war is an example of how joint cohesion saved the state and the people;

Ensure that the requirements of the EU's environmental and climate acquis are taken into account, which will facilitate both green recovery and rebuilding and **Ukraine's EU membership**;

Focus efforts not only on government interests, but also on the **needs of communities and residents**, on the need to localize processes, as communities act as beneficiaries and they will also implement measures to rebuild and restore Ukraine on the ground;

Ensure further digitalization of national and international rebuilding and recovery processes, which is a key mechanism for ensuring the processes are transparent and accessible.

In addition, taking into account the processes and events related to Ukraine's further recovery and rebuilding in 2023, the following recommendations can be made for specific stakeholders.

To implement the principle of "building back greener and better", the <u>VRU and CMU</u> need to:

Develop a clear understanding of the principles of green recovery and define criteria, indicators, and a methodology for taking environmental and climate issues into account in all the state's policies and plans;

Develop a roadmap for taking into account environmental and climate issues in all (both general and sectoral; national, regional, and local) policies for Ukraine's recovery and rebuilding;

Take into account the principle of green recovery when developing and adopting laws and bylaws, which could be introduced during the examination of relevant projects, verifying their compliance and adherence to this principle.

To organize the architecture of strategic planning for Ukraine's rebuilding and recovery, the CMU and <u>central public authorities</u> need to:

Streamline the hierarchy of the strategic planning document system for Ukraine's rebuilding and recovery and ensure coherence;

Develop a long-term vision of Ukraine's rebuilding and recovery, which should be based on a **national strategic document** that reflects the vision of Ukraine's development and future.

To institutionalize the reconstruction process in the relevant ministry, the CMU and the Ministry of Environment need to:

Introduce the position of Deputy Minister of Environmental Protection and Natural Resources, who will be responsible for the recovery of Ukraine's environment and for taking into account environmental and climate issues in all state policies and plans;

Prioritize reforms to help Ukraine's environment recover from the effects of the war and its subsequent rebuilding, which would at least put the issue of environmental recovery on an equal footing with government efforts to rebuild infrastructure and the economy, bring people back, etc.

To digitalize Ukraine's rebuilding and engage civil society, <u>the Ministry</u> <u>of Reconstruction and the Ministry of Environment</u> need to:

Strengthen the digitalization of national processes, in particular on the DREAM electronic platform, including and developing e-democracy, opportunities to use deliberative democracy formats in government decision-making or setting political agendas in various areas, etc.;

Introduce a digital service for environmental recovery, which can be realized by incorporating it into existing digital tools (DREAM, EcoSystem, etc.) or developing a new one.

To ensure rebuilding process are transparent and civil society participates, the EU and international partners need to:

Identify mechanisms and involve civil society in monitoring and oversight, in particular, in implementing the Ukraine Plan within the Ukraine Facility;

Digitalize international processes, for example, consider creating an electronic platform based on the website of the Multi-Stakeholder Donor Coordination Platform for Ukraine, which should include a segment for public awareness and engagement.

To increase effective and efficient engagement with and participation in green recovery and rebuilding processes, <u>civil society</u> needs to:

Initiate proposals for developing a cooperation mechanism, including interaction and dialogue in the "Ukraine – international partners — the public" triangle which, for example, could be introduced by civil society platforms (in particular, within the framework of the Association Agreement, and/or the Eastern Partnership);

Initiate cooperation with the International Working Group on the Environmental Consequences of War to increase the openness and accessibility of its activities;

Use international platforms to promote and lobby for Ukraine's green recovery and rebuilding.

APPENDIXES

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

POLICY PAPER - JANUARY - FEBRUARY 2024

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

APPENDIX 1.

TIMELINE OF EVENTS - REBUILDING AND RECOVERY OF UKRAINE

LEGEND

Institutional measures (e.g., establishing a ministry/agency/institution/position) Communication activities (e-platforms, etc.)

Conferences, etc.

Legal measures (national and international regulations, strategies, projects, etc.) Programming and financial activities (programs, projects, bank initiatives, etc.) Statements, assessments, recommendations, etc.

2024

PLANNED ACTIVITIES/EVENTS IN 2024

Holding a Conference on Ukraine's Recovery (June 11-12, Berlin, URC-2024)

Full implementation of the Public Participation Module (eDem) in DREAM

Submission of draft regulations by the Government of Ukraine:

- Law on the basic principles of climate policy (June)
- National Waste Management Plan 2033 (December)
- National Energy and Climate Plan 2030 (September)
- Methodological recommendations on including a climate component in comprehensive recovery programs and other national and/or local planning documents to overcome the consequences of Russia's armed aggression against Ukraine
- Long-term low-carbon development strategy
- Action Plan for establishing a national greenhouse gas emissions trading system

	March 18, 2024 Approval of the Plan for the Ukraine Facility (within the framework of the EU's financial support program for Ukraine 2024-2027)	
	February 29, 2024 Adoption of the Regulation (EU) establishing the Ukraine Facility	C
	February 15, 2024 Release of the Third Rapid Damage and Recovery Needs Assessment (RDNA-3)	C
<u> </u>	February 14, 2024 Publication of the draft National Energy and Climate Plan of Ukraine 2025-2030	C
	February 9, 2024 Publication of "Environmental Treaty for Ukraine" recommendations	C
	February 9, 2024 Approval of the Action Plan for implementing the Euro- pean Commission's recommendations presented in the Ukraine's Progress Report under the EU's 2023 Enlargement Package	
	February 5, 2024 Publication of the Draft Law of Ukraine "On the Fundamental Principles of the State Climate Policy"	
	January 26, 2024 Publication of the draft Strategy for development and implementation of State Climate Change Policy 2035	
	January 12, 2024 Signing of the Security Cooperation Agreement between the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and Ukraine	C

December 29, 2023 Approval of the Long-term Strategy for Thermal Modernization of Buildings 2050	C
December 21, 2023 Adoption of the "Rebuilding of Ukraine" National Plan by Finland	C
December 14, 2023 Publication of the draft Strategy for the Development of Innovation Activities of Ukraine 2030 (WINWIN Innovation Vision of Ukraine)	C
December 12, 2023 Publication of the draft National Waste Management Plan of Ukraine 2033 (SEA procedure was launched)	C
December 5, 2023 Publication of the draft State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027 (new edition)	C
December 5, 2023 The kick-off meeting of the "Community Support Team" Working Group of the Ministry of Reconstruction	C
December 2023 Establishment of 10 Recovery and Development Offices (UNDP in Ukraine)	C
November 28 – December 1, 2023 The International Conference on Green Recovery of Ukraine in Vilnius	C
November 16, 2023 Establishment of the Ukrainian Community Recovery Fund (UCRF). A meeting of the Supervisory Board was held on December 22 to approve the first allocation of funds	C
November 14, 2023 Presentation of the Methodology for developing a program for comprehensive recovery of the territory of a territorial community	C

October 21, 2023 Launch of the Ukrainian Climate Office	
October 21-22, 2023 The "United for Justice. United for Nature" international conference	
October 20, 2023 Approval of the Methodological recommendations for prioritizing projects to eliminate the consequences caused by the armed aggression of the Russian Federation against Ukraine	C
September 14, 2023 Penny Pritzker is appointed U.S. Special Representative for Ukraine's Economic Recovery	C
August 30, 2023 Publication of a Joint Position on the "Ukraine Plan " within the framework of the Ukraine Facility program (NGOs Ecoaction and Ecoclub)	
August 14, 2023 Launch of the Recovery and Rebuilding workstreams of the U-LEAD with Europe Programme	
August 4, 2023 Approval of the Procedure for elaborating regional development strategies and action plans for their implementation, as well as monitoring the implementation of these strategies and action plans	
July 2023 Launch of the Polish Service for the Rebuilding of Ukraine, a project to support the process of modernization and rebuilding of Ukraine	ľ
June 29, 2023 The kick-off meeting of the International Working Group on the Environmental Consequences of War	C
June 21, 2023 Launch of the Ukraine Investment Platform and signing of a Memorandum between EBRD and international development institutions	Ľ

	June 21-22, 2023	
	The Ukraine Recovery Conference (London, URC-2023)	
	June 13, 2023 Introduction of positions of deputy minister or deputy head of regional state administrations for recovery (in 8 ministries and 12 regions)	
<u> </u>	April 21, 2023 Approval of the Energy Strategy of Ukraine 2050	Z
	April 21, 2023 Approval of the Procedure for Providing Compensation for the Recovery of Certain Categories of Immovable Property Damaged as a Result of Hostilities, Terrorist Acts, and Sabotage Caused by the Armed Aggression of the Russian Federation Using the eVindovlenya Electronic Public Service	C
	March 27, 2023 Launch of an electronic resource, the Platform for Rebuilding Ukraine (Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development of Germany)	
	March 21, 2023 Launch of the IMF's Extended Fund Facility (EFF) for Ukraine	
	March 29, 2023 Launch of the EU Fund for Ukraine, approved by the EIB as part of the EU Initiative for Ukraine (EU4U)	
	March 20, 2023 Release of the 2 nd Rapid Damage and Recovery Needs Assessment (RDNA-2)	
	February 27, 2023 Launch of the Cities4Cities United4Ukraine partnership initiative	2
	February 21, 2023 Establishment of the State Agency for Restoration and Development of Infrastructure of Ukraine (based on Ukravtodor)	

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

 \square

 \square

February 2, 2023

Launch of Actions for Ukraine, an NEB capacity building program

January-December 2023

Regional forums "Manifesto of Civil Society in Drafting and Implementation of the Ukraine's Recovery Plan"

December 16, 2022 Launch of the URTF, a World Bank financial instrument	
December 12, 2022 Launch of the Interagency Donor Coordination Platform for Ukraine	2
December 2, 2022 Establishment of the Ministry of Reconstruction (reorganization of the Ministry of Community, Territorial and Infrastructure Development)	
December 1, 2022 Introduction of the position of Vice Prime Minister for the Recovery of Ukraine – Minister of Community, Territorial and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine	
November 15, 2022 Start of beta testing of the updated functionality of the government electronic ecosystem DREAM (to be presented at the London Recovery Conference in 2023)	
November 3, 2022 Establishment of the Fund for Elimination of the Con- sequences of Armed Aggression (as part of a special fund of the State Budget of Ukraine)	
October 25, 2022 The Berlin Conference (International Expert Conference on Rebuilding, Recovery and Modernization of Ukraine)	

October 14, 2022

Approval of the Procedure for the Development, Public Discussion, Approval of Programs for the Comprehensive Recovery of Oblast, Territory of the Territorial Community (a part thereof) and Amendments thereto $\lceil \rceil$

 $\lceil \rceil$

 $\left[\right]$

٢Ż

 $\lceil \rceil \rceil$

 $\lceil \rceil \rceil$

 \square

 $\lceil \rceil \rceil$

September 29-30, 2022

"From Resilience to Recovery – The Key Role of Ukrainian Civil Society" Conference (Kyiv-Lviv)

September 9, 2022

Publication of the Position paper on the draft recovery plan (consortium of civil society organizations)

September 9, 2022

Publication of the RDNA

July 4-5, 2022

Ukraine Recovery Conference (Lugano, URC-2022)

July 4, 2022

Publication of the Civil Society Manifesto 2022 (Lugano Declaration)

July 1, 2022

Launch of NEFCO's Green Recovery Program for Ukraine

June 29, 2022

Launch of the European Alliance of Cities and Regions for the Reconstruction of Ukraine

June 21, 2022

Publication of the Appeal of Working Group 5 "Energy, Transport, Environment and Climate Change" of the EU-Ukraine CSP and Working Group 3 of the EaP CSF NP

June 7, 2022

Launch of PEACE, World Bank

May 18, 2022

European Commission releases "Ukraine Relief and Reconstruction" communications POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

May-December 2

Work on the draft Action Plan for the Post-War Recover and Development of Ukraine	y 了
April 21, 2022 Establishment of the National Council for the Recovery c Ukraine from the War	of 🔼
April 2022 Launch of the UNDP Recovery Framework for Ukraine	C

March 4, 2022

Approval of Ukraine Solidarity Urgent Response package, EIB \square

APPENDIX 2.

MAPPIN PROCES STAKEH (2023)

are the processes

green

How

APPING OF PROCESSES AND TAKEHOLDERS 2023)		Involvement in processe											
		National stakeholders							International stakeholders				
		President of Ukraine	CMU	Central executive bodies	"Oblast (military) administrations"	Local governments	Business	NGOS	IFIS	G7	N	ΕU	Other states
	1.	NATION	IAL POL	ITICAL	PROCE	SSES			I				
1.1 National planning processes													
Post-War Recovery and Development Plan for Ukraine	2	2	4	4	1	1	2	2	0	0	0	0	0
Ukraine Plan (Ukraine Facility)	2	2	4	4	2	3	3	2	0	0	1	4	1
		1.	2 Sector	al proces	sses								
Regional development strategy (draft)	1	1	4	4	3	3	3	3	1	1	1	1	1
Other sectoral strategies	1	1	4	4	2	1	3	2	1	1	1	1	1
			1.3 Local	process	ies								
Local processes	1	1	3	3	4	4	2	3	1	1	3	3	3
		1.4. No	n-govern	imental p	processe	S							
Non-governmental (green) processes	1	1	1	3	3	3	1	4	1	1	3	3	3
		2. INTE	RNATIO	NAL PF	OCESSI	ES							
		2.1 Gene	eral inter	national	process	es							
Recovery conferences	2	2	4	4	2	3	4	2	3	4	2	4	3
International donor coordination platform	1	1	4	3	1	1	1	1	4	4	1	4	2
International Group on the Environmental Consequences of War	1	4	1	4	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
	2.2	nternatio	onal assis	stance ar	nd coope	eration							
International macro-financial assistance	2	3	4	4	2	2	2	1	4	3	1	4	3
Ukraine Facility	1	0	4	4	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	4	1
Other technical and non-budgetary assistance programs	1	1	3	4	3	3	3	2	4	1	4	4	3
Bilateral cooperation with states	1	2	3	3	3	3	2	3	2	1	3	2	4

MAPPING OF PROCESSES AND STAKEHOLDERS **LEGEND**

The purpose of the mapping is to schematically reflect:

involvement of stakeholders in national and international processes for the rebuilding of Ukraine,
 grren nature of national and international processes to rebuild Ukraine (full consideration of environmental and climate issues, the principle of "building back better and greener").

Processes were mapped by type or by individual processes, given the importance of the latter in shaping the agenda and determining measures for the recovery and rebuilding of Ukraine).

To reflect the degree of 'involvement', stakeholders are divided into the following categories:

- 4 key player
- 3 active participant
- 2 observer (consultations)
- 1 did not participate
- 0 no information available

The environmental friendliness of national and international processes to rebuild Ukraine is <u>color-coded</u> as follows:

green – processes take into account environmental and climate issues (fully or almost fully); yellow – processes partially take into account environmental and climate issues; POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

APPENDIX 3.

EXAMPLES OF GOOD PRACTICES OF INTERACTION BETWEEN THE PUBLIC AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS IN UKRAINE'S POST-WAR REBUILDING AND RECOVERY

3.1 STATE REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

Public participation in the development of public policies

The process of updating the State Regional Development Strategy is an example of ensuring broad stakeholder involvement in the process. This contributed to the credibility of the process and its results, integrating environmental and climate issues into post-war reconstruction planning, and taking public interests into account.

The State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027 is the main planning document in the regional policy system. It was obvious that the current version of the Strategy, adopted on August 5, 2020, did not meet modern-day challenges. The main reasons for updating the Strategy in 2023 were the challenges associated with taking into account the consequences of Russia's full-scale invasion of Ukraine and the impact on territorial communities and regions, increasing security and resilience to external factors, as well as Ukraine's achievement of EU candidate status.

How the work on drafting (developing) the new strategy was organized

Preparations for the Strategy update process began in February-March 2023 and initial meetings were held with partner countries. As a result, updating the State Regional Development Strategy 2027 was identified as a priority.

Maximum participation was one of the principles of developing the new strategy. To this end, experts were invited to submit proposals during online/in-person sectoral meetings in a mixed format (written and oral). The formal process of public discussion (the public submitting comments and suggestions on the draft updated Strategy) was December 5-21, 2023.

On July 20, 2023, the selection of experts for seven sectoral expert groups was announced with the participation of the Vice Prime Minister for Restoration. The groups were formed in accordance with seven challenges: environmental protection, security, e-government, human capital, infrastructure, economy, and institutions.

As a result, about 300 independent experts, researchers, civic activists, and representatives from more than 60 NGOs, think tanks, and international organizations were involved in the 5-month long work on updating the Strategy and developed 3,000 proposals. More than 40 conference calls between various working groups were held, which allowed creating the Strategy with sectoral policies put on the map. Strategic sessions and thematic discussions were held to develop priority reforms and specific solutions, including strengthening communities' financial capacity.

regional development strategy takes a key place The in the architecture of post-war recovery and overcoming the consequences of war. Creating various non-governmental platforms for public participation in recovery planning processes helped to attract various environmental organizations that were looking for ways to advocate for green recovery. There is a tendency to recognize the principle of "building back greener." Some elements of green recovery were integrated into the new Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027.

Timeline:

August 2023 – Active work on the strategy started.

August 8, 2023 – A kick-off meeting of the expert teams was held in the format of an online conference.

August 10, 2023 – The Ministry of Regional Development announced on its website that work on updating the provisions of the State Strategy for Regional Development 2021-2027 had begun. At the same time, a letter was sent to all stakeholder agencies: 18 central executive bodies, 25 oblast state administrations, and four all-Ukrainian associations of local government bodies. Everyone was also given the opportunity to submit their own proposals by September 10, 2023.

August 17, 2023 – The initial vision of the challenges and analytical part of the Strategy were presented at a public event.

October 30, 2023 – The Ministry of Reconstruction published a draft of the updated Strategy on its website, based on the results of expert consultations and discussions.

December 5, 2023 – The Ministry's posted information on its website about the publication of draft CMU Resolution "On Amendments to the State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027" for public discussion. Comments and suggestions were accepted until December 21, 2023.

November 29-December 29, 2023 – Public discussion held about the Report on the Strategic Environmental Assessment of the State Regional Development Strategy 2021-2027.

December 19, 2023 – Public presentation of the updated Regional Development Strategy. Oleksandra Azarkhina, Deputy Minister of Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development of Ukraine emphasized that the draft strategy was developed to align key points with the Ukraine Facility and the RDNA framework. This was done to synchronize Ukraine's multi-level governance system with existing international support and needs assessment instruments.

The Good Governance Fund project "Community Recovery Planning" supported presenting the updated State Strategy for Regional

POST-WAR GREEN RECONSTRUCTION OF UKRAINE: PROCESSES, STAKEHOLDERS, PUBLIC PARTICIPATION POLICY PAPER — JANUARY – FEBRUARY 2024

Development. The project supports the recovery of Ukraine's territorial communities and improves the government's capacity to manage regional development projects. It is implemented by the Ministry of Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development, Abt Britain, and KPMG in Ukraine with UK government.

3.2 NEB AND COOPERATION WITH UKRAINE DURING THE WAR

Strengthening community capacity

The NEB concept is an updated platform for implementing the ideas of the European Green Deal. Support for Ukraine during the war is implemented within the framework of the NEB project Actions for Ukraine. One of the key areas of work with Ukraine includes building the capacity of local authorities in Ukraine.

The Bauhaus concept emerged in the early 20th century. Founded by the architect Walter Gropius, it was based on the idea of combining art and industry.

In order to achieve the goal of climate neutrality in Europe by 2050, the EU proposed introducing the New European Bauhaus. The main features of this concept are beautiful, sustainable, and made together. NEB brings together various stakeholders (experts, entrepreneurs, artists) to develop innovative ways and forms of construction; find common energy-efficient solutions to complex social problems; and shape thinking, behavior, and markets around new ways of living and building, including through greening public procurement.

With the outbreak of Russia's full-scale war against Ukraine, the EU launched a special NEB project, Actions for Ukraine. In order to develop capacity for Ukraine's recovery, a series of online webinars grouped into three main modules was held in April–June 2023 to inspire and assist representatives of Ukrainian society in the country's recovery and rebuilding based on the values of the European Green Deal and NEB.

Participants included mayors; heads of community groups, local authorities, departments, and utilities; members of initiative groups;

project managers; and architects. Teams from 65 Ukrainian cities attended, and the program aroused considerable interest from both Ukraine and the European community. More than 1,000 people registered for the first module.

Next steps of the New European Bauhaus for Ukraine

After the first series of webinars for Ukrainians, EU representatives saw the need to continue and deepen their assistance to municipalities in Ukraine. They plan to continue the training and expect it will become more practical and analytical.

The work to support Ukraine will take place not only online but also on the ground. Emphasis is placed on planning for reconstruction based on NEB's basic principles. Some municipalities have already started working with NEB representatives.

3.3 CSOs HELP UKRAINIAN COMMUNITIES

Involving the public in the practical rebuilding of communities

Environmental NGOs make an important contribution to restoring energy security to Ukrainian communities. Renewable green energy is an important element of Ukraine's reconstruction, helping communities switch to decentralized and sustainable energy sources.

According to the CMU, since the beginning of Russia's full-scale invasion, part of Ukraine's energy infrastructure has been completely destroyed, with about 50% severely damaged. The targeted destruction of the Ukrainian energy sector has become a huge challenge and has prompted Ukrainians to look for alternative energy sources.

NGOs are making a significant contribution to introducing green energy technologies and the reconstructing critical infrastructure and residential buildings via small pilot projects. Thanks to funding from the EU and various foundations, CSOs support communities that need help rebuilding and are ready to develop renewable energy sources with funds and advice. This approach allows them to gain important practical experience in designing, procuring, installing, and operating renewable energy sources at social infrastructure facilities.

A striking example of this is the joint work of the NGOs Ecoclub and Ecoaction, which help communities implement renewable energy programs, like installing solar panels, analyzing needs, and developing solutions for transitioning to clean energy.

An example of a successful project was the rebuilding of an outpatient clinic in Horenka, Kyiv Oblast. A "green rebuilding" of the hospital was initiated by the Hostomel Military-Civilian Administration and Greenpeace, in partnership with Ekodiya, Ekoklub, and Peremoha Ukrainy Charitable Foundation. The outpatient clinic was the first healthcare facility in Ukraine to be comprehensively renovated using the most advanced green technologies. A ground-to-water heat pump and a solar power plant were put into operation. The 20-kW heat pump accumulates heat from the ground and transfers it to the heating system via an external circuit. Solar panels with a capacity of 12 kW and an 8-kWh battery were installed on the outpatient clinic roof. During one year of operation, the heat pump saved the outpatient clinic 43% on heating costs and the solar power plant covered 55% of the outpatient clinic's electricity consumption. Solar electricity can be used for autonomous living for up to 150 days a year. The outpatient clinic Horenka is a clear example of how the principles of green renovation can be used to improve energy efficiency and reduce CO₂ emissions and negative environmental impacts.

Rebuilding the heating system and installing solar panels in Horenka cost about €56,000, which will be fully recouped in 6-7 years due to energy savings and electricity generated by the outpatient clinic.

3.4 DREAM, A UNIFIED DIGITAL ECOSYSTEM FOR RECOVERY MANAGEMENT

Transparent and democratic recovery

DREAM is a state-owned electronic ecosystem that collects, organizes, and publishes open data at all stages of recovery projects in real time. It is an example of government and CSOs working together on systemic recovery projects.

DREAM collects all project data online; displays the data in convenient tables, graphs and charts; and ensures the publication of open data in accordance with the global Open Contracting Data Standard. The DREAM ecosystem allows you to control every stage of project life cycle, from registering damage and destruction, to financing, procurement, construction work, and commissioning facilities. The platform's data is available through an API that makes it much easier for the public to work with.

On August 26, 2022, the Ministry of Infrastructure and RISE Ukraine signed a memorandum of cooperation to develop the DREAM ecosystem. In 2023, the Ministry of Infrastructure, the Recovery Agency, and the DREAM Project Office developed the platform, with the support of Transparency International Ukraine and BRDO and in close cooperation with civil society and international partners. It was first presented at the URC-London. On November 15, 2023, the state-owned DREAM electronic ecosystem was launched.

DREAM – sustainable recovery of Ukraine

DREAM declares sustainable development as one of the key principles of Ukraine's recovery, which includes environmental friendliness, energy efficiency, and inclusiveness.

A working subgroup on sustainable building design, led by the NGO ReThink, was created to implement the principle of sustainability by creating a basic sustainability guide to comply with the principles of circular economy, green design, sustainable urbanism, green materials, and energy solutions.

In fall 2023, the Ministry for Communities, Territories and Infrastructure Development approved methodological recommendations for prioritizing projects to address the consequences of Russia's armed aggression. The methodology was developed based on the recommendations of organizations that are members of the RISE Ukraine coalition and contains indices, criteria, and indicators for prioritizing projects based on a scoring system. The methodology uses a number of environmental and climate criteria.

Developing the eDem module in the DREAM ecosystem has begun to engage the public in rebuilding Ukraine. The main goal of eDem is to ensure transparent and democratic reconstruction. Its tasks include engaging citizens, submitting proposals, public oversight, e-voting and e-surveys, establishing project teams, discussing projects, training, and sharing best practices. The project is currently under development.

3.5 VOZNESENSK COMMUNITY

The path of rebuilding

The Voznesensk community is a symbol of Ukrainian resilience and fortitude. Despite Russia's horrific destruction of infrastructure, the community continues to recover and plan for a "green recovery," thanks to the joint efforts of the Voznesensk community and public and environmental activists.

The town of Voznesensk identified green reconstruction as its main strategic goal and a constant development path. Despite significant damage resulting from Russia's aggression and constant attacks, the Voznesensk community remains united and is striving for a greener future.

The Resource Center for Green Recovery of Mykolaiv Oblast, a coalition of local organizations and councils (ECO-RC), and the Mykolaiv City Development Fund (MCDF) are developing, improving, and reconstructing the community via the Green Recovery of Mykolaiv Oblast initiative. UNDP was a project donor, with financial support from the Government of Denmark and the Economic Partnership Agreement Implementation Unit (EPAIU), implemented by IRI with financial support from Sweden.

ECO-RC creates development programs, consults with experts, forms working groups, and cooperates with volunteers to restore community buildings. The MCDF handles the green component, establishing communication between the community and city authorities. With the mayor's support, the foundation's activists created the "School of Civic Action" on community recovery. Trainings (focus groups, roundtables) were held for local residents, environmental activists, and experts on green recovery planning.

Public review of the Voznesensk Sustainable Development Strategy 2019-2026 and an analysis of local regulations identified a number of problems. A special group was set up to develop the Voznesensk Community Recovery Plan and to allow for green modernization of the Development Strategy.

After the training, local residents submitted 44 green proposals for the community's comprehensive recovery, such as creating green recreation areas, improving the environmental conditions of the Mertvovid River, reconstructing the solid waste landfill, installing solar power plants, and tree care and stock-taking. The city council instructed the working group to consider community residents' suggestions when updating the strategy.

Involving citizens in decision-making has become institutionalized via the Green Recovery Resource Center, where community members can participate in discussing and planning local documents.

In 2023, the Voznesensk City Council planned to create a sustainable Energy Development and Climate Plan 2030 for the Voznesensk territorial community. In December 2023, the strategy was updated with measures from the Program for Reforming and Developing the Housing and Utility Services of the Voznesensk Territorial Community. In particular, it included converting four boiler houses to biofuel, establishing a municipal solar power plant, modernizing the water supply and sewage system, and introducing an innovative solid waste management system based on separate waste collection and composting technologies.

In addition to strategic and planning activities, the community used green reconstruction measures, installing a solid fuel biomass boiler and diesel electric generator that provides heat to a Voznesensk gymnasium and school, a local outpatient clinic, and a municipal institution. The community residents are actively involved in monthly green clean-ups, i.e., cleaning up landfills, recreation areas near the Pivdennyi Buh River, and sorting waste.

